

Q

**COUNCIL
15 JANUARY 2019**

**MEMBER QUESTION TIME
Questions submitted in accordance with Standing Order 12**

1. Councillor Richard Dunbar

Can the Portfolio Holder give an explanation of Bradford's Housing First Pilot, anticipated outcomes and what would be needed to successfully roll out the programme?

Answer

Housing First is an internationally-recognised model of meeting the needs of homeless people with multiple and complex needs. The model is all about placing people directly into their own home and tenancy, then providing them with flexible and intensive support to tackle their other issues; they don't have to first navigate a pathway of supported hostel/housing or to become 'tenancy ready' before getting a home.

Bradford's Housing First pilot will run for one year from 6th August 2018 and will test the Housing First accommodation model for people who have complex needs that manifest in the following types of issues: rough sleeping; dual diagnosis (mental health & substance misuse); sex working; long term stayers in B&B and addressing early chaotic behaviours (Early Intervention - Children to Adult service transfer).

The pilot will support up to 16 clients during the year. A complex needs panel has been established to screen referrals for the project and to ensure service flexibility for clients whilst in the project. The membership of the panel includes housing providers, health providers, social care provision, the substance misuse consortium and the police. Fourteen places have been allocated on the pilot and two places are being reallocated in January due to one service user successfully entering rehab and one service user not wanting the support. Demand for places on the pilot has significantly outstripped the number of spaces available. The Housing First support provision has been established and workers are in post.

Individual outcomes that will be reported at the six month point and twelve month point of the contract (February and August 2019) are:

- Number of people referred to the service and number of people accepted into the pilot.
- Percentage of people sustaining accommodation.
- Improvements in health and wellbeing.
- Reduction in emergency health services such as ambulance call-outs and A&E attendances.
- Increased social, family and community networks.

- Engagement in substance misuse treatment.
- Reduced anti-social behaviour and offending.
- Report on negative outcomes e.g. property damage.

The project is overseen by a Development Board that receives regular reports on the project. Significant work has been done to engage clients, complete personalised plans and to start to move clients into accommodation of their choosing. Four of the client group are now in their long term home with another three moving into accommodation in the next two weeks. Of the remaining nine, only two clients are not already in short term accommodation, pending their long term solution being found. All of the clients receive intensive Housing First support irrespective of where they live to ensure that once in permanent accommodation there is the best chance of it being sustainable.

One of the main priorities for the project is to develop pathways into accommodation for people with the highest need and risk as these are people who would normally be refused accommodation. National learning shows that in some locations securing property is a barrier for Housing First. Although there is still work to do on Housing First accommodation pathways in Bradford, some success is starting to develop especially around accessing the private rented sector through the Council's Private Sector Letting Scheme.

The strategic vision for Housing First is firstly to review the pilot at the six month point to ascertain whether there are indicators this model works for Bradford. Secondly to ensure that the Council's Supported Housing Needs assessment calculates the need for this type of provision in Bradford and finally to determine whether to build the Housing First model into the housing-related support commissioning process in the next twelve months. In the meantime the Council has submitted bids for Government funding to try and increase the spaces available on the pilot through the Controlling Migration Fund, the Rapid Rehousing Early Adopters Fund and another bid will be submitted this month through the Rough Sleep Initiative Fund.

2. Councillor Debbie Davies

As Bradford is now in joint 125th position (out of 152 local authorities nationally) for combined Reading, Writing and Maths at the end of Key Stage 2, compared to joint 124th position in 2017, can the Portfolio Holder for Education clarify his claim that standards are rising?

Answer

Key Stage 2 Reading, writing and mathematics combined:

	2016	2017	2018
Bradford	47%	57%	61%
National	53%	61%	64%

The table above demonstrates that combined attainment in Reading, writing and mathematics at Key Stage 2 has improved in Bradford by 4 percentage points

between 2017 and 2018 (and by 14 percentage points between 2016 and 2018) which supports the statement that “standards are rising”. Importantly, this data shows that Bradford has a better rate of improvement than the national picture which has improved by 3 percentage points between 2017 and 2018 and of 11 percentage points between 2016 and 2018.

There is no escaping the fact that standards in Bradford at the end of Key Stage 2 are still below the national average, however, the gap between Bradford and the national has closed from 6% below in 2016 to 4% below in 2017 and is now 3% below in 2018.

3. Councillor Jeanette Sunderland

Can the Portfolio Holder confirm if a contract is jointly signed by a Chair of Governors appointed by a local authority to a local authority-run school and a senior employee of the same local authority what is the relationship between the local authority and the contract?

Answer

In essence, it would depend on what the nature of the contract is and what is written into the contract which should define that relationship. Further details would need to be provided to procurement or legal to establish this relationship.

Supplementary Question

Do I take it from this response then if I provide a copy of the contract that the Council will then publish the legal advice on it?

Councillor Imran Khan

Yes that is what I put in the answer is if you can give us the details then we are happy to look at it and take a decision and come back to you.

4. Councillor Kevin Warnes

The Leader of Council will be aware that a traffic calming scheme for Caroline Street was finalised, costed against identified funding and endorsed by Cllr Martin Love and myself back in June 2018, yet has not progressed since then. Will the Leader please explain this long delay, publish in full the advice provided to the highways team by heritage officers, and confirm whether or not highways and heritage officers have consulted with relevant external organisations about this scheme?

Answer

Officers met with Ward Members in June 2018 with a draft proposal for Caroline Street. Meetings between Highways and Heritage Officers subsequently took place following this. Heritage Officers advised that changes would need to be made to the scheme given its prominent location within the World Heritage Site. Discussions are on-going. Additional funding will likely have to be identified to accommodate heritage conservation concerns. The proposal has therefore not yet been through the Council's decision-making process.

Supplementary Question

Thank you very much for the answer except it is not really an answer to be honest. The answer you have given me does not tell us what advice has been provided to the Highways Department by the Heritage officers. We understand that two pages of advice was offered and what we want from this question is all that information published so that we can see what changes need to be made, so that we can understand the ongoing discussions between Heritage and the Highways team so that we can understand how much more money might be required for the changes on Caroline Street in Saltaire and finally what is the time scale? We have been waiting about two years for this to happen and I would love to have more information from the Executive on this one please.

Councillor Alex Ross-Shaw

It certainly was not the intention not to answer the question but obviously there are differing versions of the account in so much as it was never approved and therefore in terms of time scales it has never got to a point where it has been approved and then been stopped, it always needed to go through that decision making process. I have been in touch with Conservation officers to ask them to sit down with Highways officers and let us look at what would be acceptable. In a World Heritage Site if that requires additional funding then that will need to be identified and there is no time scale for that because we do not know where that funding would come from at this stage but obviously we want to know what would work, if anything, and if so, how do we move that forward so that is why discussion are ongoing and we will keep you informed and be in touch.

5. Councillor Michael Stelling

In the interest of public openness and transparency will this Council seek to amend the constitution under section 12 (Member Question Time) item 12.14 for questions submitted under Standing Order 12.5.1 but not included as a nominated priority question, where written answers will be circulated to all members. Priority questions are in the public domain via attendance of meeting, webcast and viewable on the Council website. Will this Council make the non-priority questions submitted accessible in the public domain like the priority questions i.e. - via the Council's website?

Answer

The current arrangements for Member Question Time were approved as an amendment to the Constitution at the meeting of Council on 21 May 2013. Paragraph 12.14 of Part 3A, Rules of Procedure, in the Council's Constitution states that "A written answer will be circulated to all members to any question submitted under Standing Order 12.5.1 but not included as a nominated priority question or on the list produced under Standing Order 12.8 within 20 working days of the Council meeting to which they were submitted." In other words that means that any question submitted by a member which is not included on the agenda for Member Question Time is answered later within 20 working days from the date of the Council meeting and the answer is then circulated to all members (by e-mail).

To alter the arrangements a change to the Council's Constitution would have to be made which would involve consultation with the political groups. If the change is

agreed the Governance and Audit Committee would be consulted and if supported a recommendation made to Council. There are no resource implications for the Committee Secretariat and Members Support in complying with this request. If agreed Members of Council would continue to be sent an e-mail containing the answers to those questions answered after a meeting of Council but in addition the answers would be posted on the Council's website with the other documentation relating to a particular meeting of Council.

6. Councillor Richard Dunbar

Would the leader agree that the recent 3% rise in train fares is an insult to users considering the overcrowding, cancellations and lack of investment in rail infrastructure?

Answer

Yes. In the 21st century it is outrageous that our rail transport system should be straining at the seams as it is. Passengers in the north have had terrible daily journeys since the new timetable changes came in in May. The announcement in November 2018 that rail fares would increase on 2 January 2019 by an average of 3.1% just added insult to injury.

The impact of January's price increase does mean that a season ticket holder commuting between Bradford and Leeds, for example, will see the cost of their annual travel increase by £32.

Whilst this year's unwelcome increase in rail fares is outside our direct control as a Council, what we can do and what we are doing is making strong and concerted representations to government calling on it to prioritise investment in our rail services so that tangible benefits can be delivered as a result of this increase.

7. Councillor Carol Thirkill

Can the Portfolio Holder set out the steps the Council has taken so far to set the right foundations for the children's services improvement plan?

Answer

Bradford shares Ofsted's ambition that "only good is good enough for Bradford's children" and therefore the judgement is extremely disappointing. The focus is now on improving at pace the areas identified by Ofsted with the ambition of achieving good or better services for children. There have been a number of actions put in place to provide the foundations for the improvement needed.

- **Establishment of the Improvement Board.** An interim Improvement Board has been in place since the end of the inspection chaired by the Chief Executive. An Improvement Advisor will be appointed by DfE and will start to chair our Improvement Board in February 2019. This Board will oversee and lead the improvement journey.
- **Development of the Improvement Plan.** With the voice of the child at its heart, improvement planning has been a key focus of activity, involving staff at

all levels in Children's Services, with the support of corporate resources (Finance, HR, Legal and Performance) and in consultation with partners. A Planning workshop with Ofsted took place on 10th December 2018 to help inform the Improvement Plan. The Children's Services Improvement Plan will form the basis of the Statement of Action which must be submitted to Ofsted by 4th February 2019. A consultation version is being shared with the partnership and stakeholders in early January

- **Immediate actions taken.** There have been a number of service level actions taken in advance of the publication of the Improvement Plan. These include:
 - Auditing 1700 cases for children who are Child Protection and Child in Need and undertaking corrective actions where required
 - Putting in place an additional Head of Service for the MASH and Front Door to strengthen leadership capacity
 - Strengthening Quality Assurance and employing three temporary experienced auditors to review specific areas and cases
 - Undertaking on going recruitment to vacancies resulting in a very small number of unfilled posts
 - Working closely with the Teaching Partnership to put in place additional training for social workers and managers starting in January 2019
 - Putting in place additional social work oversight in the homelessness team and in the contact centre.
 - Putting in place a plan to move the early help gateway into the MASH in early January and to move to one integrated front door
 - Undertaking a review of social work salaries and retention.
 - Starting to review the use of the information management system liquid logic to ensure the most efficient and effective use of system capability
 - Putting in place some additional reports and reviewing the performance information requirement to drive and facilitate the required improvement

8. Councillor Mike Pollard

Re item reference CS0399 listed in the Capital Investment Plan appended to the Council's 2018/19 Budget Reference Document, could the Leader of the Council please state what real rate of return is being sought on 'Strategic Acquisitions' in, say, Years 1, 5 and 10 after completion of such purchases, taking into account initial fees, ongoing financing costs and any reasonably expected life cycle / replacement costs?

Answer

Each investment acquisition is treated as an invest to save project, every such project has to be self financing and also generate a net annual surplus, consequently there is no set net return at various key milestones. However we don't generally consider acquisitions that deliver a net initial yield of less than 5.75-6%, on each acquisition, the Council gives careful consideration to security of income, length of lease and location in relation to existing Council holdings which are all taken into account.

Supplementary Question

Thank you for the answer to this one. Could I just have a little clarification? The answer to the question states as follows – “each investment acquisition is treated as an invest to save project”. In the light of the new move to invest for income specifically is that answer quite accurate.

Councillor Hinchcliffe

I think it is probably just judged on a BCR Business Case Ratio basis so that is probably why it is called that but you are right, it is an invest to generate income so that the NCP car park which I spend a lot of my time talking about as a major requisition is an investment where the income that we get more than pays for the mortgage and gives us revenue besides to spend on Council services so essentially costs us nothing and generates revenue. It is very much that kind of investment that we are talking about here and that return is the ballpark of what we look for when we look for investment. It is very much case by case depending on where it is, what the potential is and the location of the site and what is around it.

9. Councillor Hassan Khan

Will the Portfolio Holder tell us how Darley Street and Piccadilly can be transformed under the new plans for that part of town?

Answer

Recent developments and shifts in key market trends have seen the main focus of the City Centre’s primary retail offer shifting from the Darley Street area to Broadway/Forster Square Retail Park with other commercial uses moving out of Piccadilly and nearby streets to other business locations in the City Centre. With these user trends likely to remain set for the future it is recognised that locations such as Darley Street and Piccadilly must seek new functions and identities to meet the Council’s aims of establishing a vibrant and sustainable City Centre for the people of Bradford.

In response, the Economic Development Team have commissioned the preparation of a City Village Master Delivery Plan covering a target area bounded by the “Top of Town” Oastler Market area to the north, Manor Row/Cheapside to the West, Market Street to the South and Sunbridge Road to the East and with the intention of carrying out infrastructure/environmental improvements and residential developments to create a revitalised urban sustainable environment that will become home to a new City Centre community.

The Master Delivery Plan will seek to stimulate the creation of a new affordable residential market through the development of up to 1,000 new homes that will create an excellent place to call home allowing people from different age ranges, backgrounds and households the opportunity to benefit from the advantages of city centre living. These efforts will centre on stimulating the development of new apartment units through the conversion of under used space in buildings on streets like Piccadilly, North Parade, Market Street, Manor Row etc., whilst at the same time developing new build homes on cleared sites including the “Top of Town” site that will be provided following the relocation of the Oastler market.

The proposed new Market development on the twin sites within the Kirkgate Centre and Darley Street will help to re-establish this location as a refreshing alternative offer to the primary Broadway/Forster Square retail destination experience with a focus on high quality food, independent shopping, cafés and leisure outlets. This culturally vibrant and “independent” offer whilst complimenting that of the primary retail locations will also be underpinned by the needs and demands of the new, growing and socially mixed city “village” community.

10. Councillor Abid Hussain

What plans does the Portfolio Holder have for business development zones or other actions to encourage good growth in all parts of the district?

Answer

Under the adopted Core Strategy the Council has a requirement to identify 135 Ha of employment land across the district to satisfy the jobs growth anticipated over the next 15 year plan period.

Recognising this is a significant amount for a district with very few large sites suitable for employment we plan to undertake area assessments of four principal traditional employment areas of the district; one in Bradford, one in Shipley and two in Keighley to assess existing employment areas and reuse land which is underperforming and make the areas attractive for further investment.

The purpose of the studies is to identify opportunities within each of the study areas where early intervention could bring forward redevelopment of existing, but underutilised or poor quality sites and consider redevelopment/expansion of existing premises to maximise site utilisation. The sites and premises would be redeveloped to meet current demand and reduce pressure on potential green belt allocations.

The studies will also look at how wider improvements across the zones such as to transport links, parking, street lighting and general environmental improvements could be undertaken to make the areas attractive for business and lead to an increase in investment from the business community.

By identifying four areas we will be able to work with business throughout the district to ensure their future needs for additional business accommodation are satisfied.

These areas are in addition to the existing City Centre Growth Zone area, which provides support to new and expanding businesses within the wider City Centre. To date almost 240 businesses have been supported with grants, business rate relief and business support. Funding has been invested in high quality public realm, the development platform for One City Park as well as a new way-finding system. The City Centre Growth Scheme has created a supportive and attractive environment and has made a significant contribution towards Bradford being named as a great place to start a business.

Funding and support is also being targeted at two areas of high need within the District, to encourage community enterprise through Community Led Local Development Programmes.

Supporting inclusive growth, the Economic Development Team is acting as the Accountable Body for these two European Structural Investment Fund programmes being delivered within defined geographies in Bradford and Keighley (focused on the 20% most deprived LSOAs (IMD 2010) in the Bradford Central wards of City, Great Horton and Manningham and Keighley wards of Keighley East, West and Central wards).

The programmes have been developed in consultation with the local communities and are led by Local Action Groups (LAG), comprised of strategic area community stakeholders representing public, private and local socio-economic interests

Local strategies have been developed for each area that prioritise a number of key activities which will be delivered through a delegated grants scheme. Business development activity to be delivered includes:

Bradford CLLD

- To establish, run and coordinate an Enterprise hub with community-based satellites, to provide an expert 'one stop shop' for business networking, skill sharing, support, including from the wider business support infrastructure, and a physical base for those who need it.
- Stimulating local level collaboration amongst small businesses, community and local organisations leading to business sustainability.
- Coordinated strategic support and development to attract investment, including enabling business clusters, marketing and communications for the CLLD area stimulating the local economy to deliver jobs and growth.

Keighley CLLD

- Small scale business grants /voucher scheme to support start-up, growth, and accessing business space and equipment.
- Activities to promote entrepreneurship and self-employment in the CLLD area.
- Support for federation/cluster development for small businesses to collaborate for a range of outcomes including progression and retention of skilled people within the key sectors and businesses.
- Tailored business support for start-ups and existing SMEs, including mentoring, coaching, information, advice and guidance, business planning, and signposting and information on skills, productivity and quality improvement support.
- Support for new forms of enterprise including social economy and social enterprises

Calls of activity have been undertaken in Keighley and it is envisaged that projects to deliver some of the activity highlighted above will commence in early 2019/20.

Bradford is in the process of developing activity calls and envisage delivery commencing in May/June 2019.

11. Councillor John Pennington

Further to the European Court of Justice ruling in July 2017, that UK local authorities had been incorrectly excluded from a VAT exemption on income from sporting facilities; can the Leader of the Council confirm whether the Council has, like many

other Councils pursued a rebate and if so in what way will it be used to benefit local residents?

Answer

Yes, we are pursuing a rebate. The Local Authority is currently in the process of submitting the claim to HMRC regarding its sporting facilities. Part of this claim was made in the last calendar year and the remainder will be submitted before the end of January.

The additional funding, once finalised, will be used to fund Council services going forward in the context of the huge central government cuts we are continuing to face.

Supplementary Question

Thank you for the answer. I would just like an insight, if you have any indication of what the value might be for this additional funding, approximately?

Councillor Hinchcliffe

We think it is about half a million pounds but we will let you know.

12. Councillor Cath Bacon

Will the Leader join me in thanking Council staff who worked through the Christmas and New Year holiday period to keep important services running particularly for vulnerable people?

Answer

Absolutely I do. We had a nucleus of dedicated individuals across the district spending their Christmas at work, or on standby, to ensure that services ran smoothly especially for vulnerable people.

Care services cannot take a day off, so I'd like to thank all the Council staff, and those at organisations who work on our behalf, who support our most vulnerable adults and children. Some of the services which never stop include residential care, emergency help for people at risk, helping people who are ill or disabled, and support for homelessness. Over the break our social care staff were particularly busy helping people being discharged from hospital on Christmas Eve and Christmas Day, and supporting people suffering with mental health illness.

Other Council unsung heroes working through Christmas include our CCTV control room team. Our winter weather team monitors the conditions and is ready to react with gritting or any other emergency response. And we have a brilliant core of on-call staff, including highways, street cleansing, emergency planning, environmental health, housing, buildings maintenance, drainage and policy and communications – all ready to respond to any crisis that might emerge in the district.

Of course, Bradford Council works in partnership and thousands of colleagues in the NHS, police, fire and rescue and other emergency services have also been hard at work regardless of the time of year. So I also say thank you to all of them for the difference they make to our communities.

13. Councillor Nicola Pollard

Can the Portfolio Holder advise Council how many people in the District are receiving care and support from a service that requires improvement, how much of that care and support is being paid for by the Council and at what cost in total per month for each of the last five years?

Answer

The specific details requested in the question would require significant officer time to analyse and estimate as the position changes daily due to many variables. The response below puts the position into context and describes the arrangements in place to support and work with care providers to deliver good quality services to the people of Bradford.

Where a provider is found to be 'inadequate' through CQC, it is highly likely that the Council will place a suspension on new cases going to that provider until the required improvements are evidenced. On very rare occasions the Council would make arrangements to move existing service users to another provider, however this is the last option as it is very disruptive and potentially risky to people in receipt of care and the Council is more likely to provide additional intensive support and monitoring, including the provision of Council staff to support service delivery on site for short periods of time. For providers that are rated 'requires improvement' the contracts team will maintain increased oversight and support until the required improvements are made and sustained.

The majority of people in receipt of adult social care support are likely to be accessing some form of CQC regulated service. There are around 5,700 people on the adult social care 'caseload' of which 1,700 are people receiving residential and nursing care and 4,200 are receiving community based care. There are around 99 different home support providers and 125 residential and nursing care home providers. The overall approximate gross weekly cost of social care support is 2.3 million, 1.2 million of which is for residential care support and 1.1 million is for community support.

The Council contracts team monitors CQC ratings of providers, along with a number of other quality indicators, and since July 2017 they have been monitoring residential and nursing care provision through the power BI system.

As of January 2019 CQC data there are 33 Bradford care homes which are rated as "requires improvement".

A snapshot of the position over the past three years for care homes is shown below:

Private/Independent care homes CQC published ratings as of 30.06.18

CQC ratings	Overall rating	Safe	Effective	Caring	Responsive	Well led
Inadequate	6	6	1	0	1	8
Requires Improvement	33	40	27	10	22	35
Good	61	57	74	88	79	55
Outstanding	1	0	1	5	1	1
No Rating/Blank	15	15	15	15	15	15
Total	117	117	117	117	117	117

Private/independent care homes CQC inspection published ratings as of 30.06.17

CQC ratings	Overall rating	Safe	Effective	Caring	Responsive	Well led
Inadequate	6	7	2	2	3	10
Requires Improvement	42	46	34	8	27	46
Good	56	52	68	89	73	49
Outstanding	1	0	1	6	2	0
No Rating/Blank (re-registered or yet to be inspected)	17	17	17	17	17	17
Total	122	122	122	122	122	122

Private/Independent care homes CQC published ratings as of 30.06.16

CQC ratings	Overall rating	Safe	Effective	Caring	Responsive	Well led
Inadequate	13	13	6	2	5	14
Requires Improvement	32	40	29	15	27	38
Good	47	39	56	73	59	40
Outstanding	0	0	1	2	1	0
No Rating/Blank (not inspected or re-registered)	32	32	32	32	32	32
Total	124	124	124	124	124	124

The trend data over the last three years (since the CQC inspection regime changed and the Council began to collect data in this way) indicates an improving picture in Bradford District care homes with fewer care homes being rated inadequate or requires improvement. The Council is committed to continuing to provide supportive challenge to our independent care sector providers to meet our aspiration that all regulated services used by Bradford people are 'good' or 'excellent'.

14. Councillor Taj Salam

Cycling events in recent years have helped to focus the eyes of people around the world on our district. Can the Portfolio Holder tell us about the UCI World Championships in 2019?

Answer

This is an elite cycling event that will race through parts of the district and which takes place on 21–29 September 2019. There will be:

- 90 National Teams
- 7,000 Riders, officials and clients
- 150 Countries global broadcast, audience figures in excess of 225 million
- Live BBC coverage
- Local, national and international spectators

This year's UCI World Championships follows on from the 2018 event that took place in Innsbruck (Austria).

Whilst not directly comparable, for reference the 2018 Tour de Yorkshire had the following impact:

- It boosted the county's economy by £98 million, according to independent research
- A record 2.6 million spectators lined the route over the four days of action between 3-6 May for the TDY
- Overall spend during the TDY was up 54 per cent from 2017 to £97,973,806
- Accommodation spend also increased 49 per cent year-on-year, while non-accommodation items such as food and drink, souvenirs and transport was up by 58 per cent.

The Women's Elite race will start in Bradford on 28 September 2019, taking an impressive 150km route from the city centre and heading through Shipley, Baildon and Menston on its way to the finish in Harrogate.

On Sunday 29 September the Men's Elite race will run through Ilkley en route to the finish in Harrogate.

The UCI 2019 will be a great celebration in the district and we will engage with schools, communities and businesses so that communities are aware and get the full benefits from hosting the event and celebrating the world coming to Yorkshire and Bradford for this world championships.

15. Councillor Val Townend

Will the Leader of the Council advise members how much money has been given in total annually to each of the Area Committees over the past 5 years giving a breakdown for every Ward in each Area Committee?

Answer

As Councillor Townend will appreciate, the Area Committees have delegated responsibility for some Council Services including aspects of Highway maintenance, Youth Service, Council Wardens, Street Cleansing and Parks. Annual reports on each of these are presented to each Area Committee. Most of the expenditure on these services is not broken down by ward as many of the budgets for staffing and materials are managed at a constituency level. In addition to this work a number of on-going and occasional grant making awards are administered through the Area Committees, which are also reported back through the Area Committee meetings. Once again, some of these grants are awarded to groups that may operate across ward boundaries or at a constituency level. The information on the grants and the devolved services is available in the public domain through the Council's committee reports that are held on the internet and officers will be more than happy to talk through any specific questions that Councillor Townend has after she has perused the relevant Council reports and minutes.

16. Councillor Vanda Greenwood

With the grand re-opening of St George's Hall imminent can the Portfolio Holder tell us how we are marking the re-opening?

Answer

We are all greatly looking forward to the reopening of the fantastic St George's Hall after its major renovations. The first show after reopening is Barbara Dickson in concert on 15 February. Officers are working on a grand red carpet official opening event on 1 and 2 June 2019 featuring high profile artists and local, amateur performers taking to the stage. Exciting plans are currently being finalised and details will be released shortly.

Councillor Vanda Greenwood

No supplementary but I very much look forward to the opening.

17. Councillor Richard Dunbar

Would the Leader set out what we as a Council are doing in conjunction with partners to tackle the harsh realities of climate change in our district?

Answer

In Bradford the Council has been making great steps in reducing its own carbon emissions and has exceeded its aims of achieving a 40% reduction in carbon emissions by 2020. The Energy Centre of the Council has a capital budget to help with targeted energy savings to reduce carbon emissions and will continue to improve the Council's carbon performance.

The Leeds City Region Local Enterprise Partnership (the LEP) has recently adopted an energy strategy and delivery plan which is the first task in a process of developing carbon targets for the region as a whole. Officers intend to use the information relevant to Bradford that was gathered to produce the city region plan as the evidence base to move forwards from here. This will identify a list of priorities for the Council and the district and will identify the steps needed to progress towards achieving these outcomes.

This process will allow Bradford Council to align its efforts with those of other local Councils and local businesses to achieve more significant results, particularly in areas such as transport where strategic alignment is extremely important. The LEP energy strategy and delivery plan sets out the ambition and is being followed up with a more targeted number of work packages that aim to provide the evidence base for the LEP to commit to emissions reduction targets. The aim is to match or exceed the commitments made at Paris to limit global warming to no more than 2 degrees above pre industrial levels. Bradford will be a leading partner in this effort.

18. Councillor Mike Ellis

Could the Portfolio Holder for Regeneration, Planning & Transport confirm what action is being considered by this Council to collect glass, paper and food waste separately, to improve quality and increase revenue?

Answer

The Council is currently processing all of its recyclates some 32,936 tonnes now compared to 14,102 tonnes in 2013 through its MRF. These recyclates once processed are of a high quality and income levels, which have been fluctuating greatly due to uncertainty in market prices, have increased. The Council currently has no plans for a food waste collection due to there being no local anaerobic processing plant. However, following the Government's recently published Waste Strategy which outlines plans for all Councils to collect Food Waste we will wait to see what the proposals are, what funding will be made available and we will respond accordingly.

19. Councillor Hassan Khan

Nationally it's a tough time for small businesses and for shops on the high street in particular. Can the Portfolio Holder tell us what the Council is doing to play its part?

Answer

The City Centre Growth Scheme continues to support small businesses to open premises within in the City Centre. Business Rate rebates are available to eligible businesses until the scheme ends in 2021. Along with new investment, jobs and adding to the distinctive offer in the City Centre these new businesses are bringing previously empty properties back into use.

The Priority Streets Scheme incentivises businesses to bring back in to use vacant ground floor units in key retail streets with high volumes of vacant properties. The area includes a number of landmark and gateway properties linking to the retail core. The package of support available includes capital grants towards property

improvements and equipment purchases along with business rate rebates.

Through its targeted grant schemes the Council is able to encourage food and drink and leisure operators into the City Centre. This supports the retail offer, strengthens the evening economy and starts to create the right mix on the high street.

Across the District's Town Centres, small businesses are also able to access support through the District Growth Scheme in the form of Business Rate Relief. 100% relief is available where vacant units are brought back into occupation.

The Invest in Bradford Team provide a wide range of support to small businesses, including advice on expansions, relocations, accessing grants and loans, exporting and more.

20. Councillor David Warburton

Will the Portfolio Holder give an update on the development of the new Sedbergh leisure centre?

Answer

The development of the new Sports Centre is progressing well. The contractor has recently advised the Council that the target handover date of August 2019 is still achievable and work is continuing in line with the current programme. All the ground works for the building and the steel frame have been completed. The block work and roof are currently well underway as well.

To date there have been no major unexpected issues with the construction and the development is within the budget that has been allocated to the scheme. The Council is looking forward to opening this exciting new facility later in the year.

Supplementary Question

Thank you very much Portfolio Holder for the update on this great modern development in Wyke Ward. With the closure of Richard Dunn Centre and the loss of cycling facilities what are the plans for cycling in the area especially around the proposed Wyke Community Sports Village on the old Wyke Manor School site and what time scale are the Council looking at so that there is a smooth transition to the new site?

Councillor Sarah Feriby

The Council are working with British Cycling and local clubs that are currently using the Richard Dunn Centre as well as new partners in the exciting new facility at Wyke Community Sporting Village. Officers and partners are currently preparing a bid for funding for the cycling and of the project through the World Road Racing Cycling legacy fund which is managed by British Cycling. Cycling plans for the site includes a closed loop track similar to the one at Richard Dunn's, pump tracks junior training and skills facilities as well as a bike library and disabled cycling facilities and it is hoped that work on the community sporting village will start later this year and be completed by 2020.

21. Councillor Jeanette Sunderland

Can the Portfolio Holder detail the work he is personally undertaking to resolve the financial and legal problems at Hanson?

Answer

The issues, which have preoccupied successive Governing bodies at the school, will not be solved by the efforts of just one person in isolation. We are working with partners to tackle these issues. This includes active dialogue with the RSC, with the Academy Trusts and with the DfE. As the Portfolio Holder and Deputy Leader I will continue to play a leading role in these discussions until a resolution is found.

Supplementary Question

Thank you for the comment in the paper however Hanson is a school with over 1,500 pupils in it now and the success of Bradford's education system will not be moved up the league tables until that school improves. It has significant numbers of pupils from ethnic minority backgrounds, people with special educational needs and people eligible for the pupil premium. Responsibility for the financial and legal problems facing the school in the words of Ofsted lie between the authority and the department. Previous Financial Director of the Council said that this requires now a political solution. Does he agree with me now more than ever that Hanson requires a political solution and will he take action personally to deliver it?

Councillor Imran Khan

First of all let me give you an assurance that we are doing all we can to resolve the issues at Hanson. The Leader has met with the Member of Parliament for Bradford East and this is an issue that has been talked about at the highest levels of government as well. We have had many conversations with the Regional Schools Commissioner, with the Governing Body and the sponsors that are up there as well. It is a problem that does need to be resolved. I agree with you it is a school that cannot be allowed to fail and rest assured we are not going to allow it to fail. There is a lot of work going on in the background and we will continue with that and hopefully soon we will be able to provide some more responses on that. I think it is in the public arena now as well that there will be another audit carried out later on this month just to give us more of an idea of where we are at with the budgets and hopefully like I say in the next few months we will be able to report more back on it.

22. Councillor Ralph Berry

To the Portfolio Holder for education, employment and skills – what is the latest progress on the Opportunity Area activities in Bradford District?

Answer

The Opportunity Area Programme has 19 of 21 lines of activity (across four key priorities) in delivery or working through the contracting process since it published its delivery plan in January 2018.

Priority 1 – Strengthening School Leadership and the quality of teaching

School to school support

- Support for up to 25 schools to receive school to school support. Three schools already receiving support in pilot. Another 14 schools matched with activity

expected from February, subject to sign-off of improvement plans. Final 8 schools identified and scheduled to be contacted this month.

- Brokered support from Teaching School Alliances and National Leaders of Education to work in partnership with identified schools, inviting system leadership support from Bradford and beyond.
- Average of £60k per school across 4 terms
- 'Implementation Matters' - support from the Bradford Research School at Dixons, building on the EEF's School's Guide to Implementation.
 - Embedding 'Implementation Matters' in schools is at the heart of our 'Evidence Active Schools' campaign. The 25 schools receiving support will help to take us toward our target of all schools being 'Evidence Active' by 2020.

Leadership

- 50 senior or middle leaders from Bradford Schools to have started their National Professional Qualification leadership courses – Achieved ^200 funded NPQ places
- 50 senior or middle leaders to have been assigned a mentor providing half a day support per term – Commission awarded - Identified 50 new to headship or new heads to Bradford identified to take part
- Development of a menu of leadership master classes for Bradford's senior and middle leaders –Commission awarded - Identified 50 new to headship or new heads to Bradford identified to take part

Wider school improvement support

- Support three schools to improve the quality of their teaching across the whole school, STEM support for six schools, Physics Leaders Programme for ten teachers. Already achieved.
- Support for the 30 lowest performing schools for primary literacy.
 - This support has been developed by a task and finish group involving the OA, local school leaders, the Bradford English Hub and the Local Authority.
 - 30 primary schools will receive £20,000 each to develop bespoke literacy improvement plans.
 - Schools have been identified and will be contacted over the coming weeks, with activity to start by Easter 2019.
 - Schools receiving literacy support will also receive Research School training on 'Implementation Matters', taking us further toward our Evidence Active target for 2020.
- Bradford for teaching tender complete – Northern Lights TSA contracted to deliver over next 18 months including
 - continuation of first phase activity (such as the bus tours)
 - more robust evaluation of impact of all activity
 - greater focus on attracting school leaders and experienced teachers
 - encouraging local entry to the teaching profession – 'grow your own'

Priority 2 –Parents and Place: Literacy and Learning

- To support improvements in outcomes for pupils, by giving parents in three areas of Bradford, the confidence and skills to inspire, influence and support their children’s learning and progression.
- 2 providers delivering over 3 areas;
 - Keighley – National Literacy Trust
 - Tong & Bowling – National Literacy Trust
 - Eccleshill and Idle – Ravenscliffe Community Association
- Providers will submit their plans this month. Plans will be reviewed and approved/changes requested by the Partnership Board 23rd January 2019

Priority 3 – Improving Access to rewarding careers

- Applications from all 206 schools and sixth forms in Bradford for Essential Life Skills funding have been made and approved.
- Primary Careers programme launched at Bradford Primary Improvement Partnership meeting on 8th November 2018.
- All 44 secondary schools and colleges have signed up to the Careers and Enterprise Co. (OA partner) Enterprise Advisor Network, with 32 matched to an Enterprise Advisor, so far.
- 39 schools have completed the Compass assessment tool relating to the Gatsby Benchmarks.
- 51,702 recorded careers encounters delivered in Bradford to the end of October 2018.
- £515,000 Careers and Enterprise investment has been distributed to schools to support careers and enterprise education through the virtual wallet.
- Funded Careers Leader training to begin in January 2018.
- Careers Education, Advice and Guidance (CEIAG) Awards funding to be available to all secondary schools from the autumn term. This is an additional offer agreed by the OA board.
- Continued consultation on the development of a careers and enterprise offer for Bradford schools and employers to report initial findings and suggestions to inform investment.
- Delivery of the Essential Life Skills underspend investments following Partnership Board consultation in September which incorporates the following investments;
 1. Extra investment in children and young people in PRUs, special schools and those in Elective Home Education. As requested under consultation with the PRUs and special schools we’ll be appointing a co-ordinator to ease the burden on schools of organising additional ELS activities. For the PRUs and special schools there will be a careers focus to activities and the co-ordinator will work to build better links between schools and employers. We’re working closely with EHE colleagues within the Council to develop a programme of delivery to EHE children and young people. EHE children and young people have not previously benefitted from our ELS investments.
 2. A task and finish group met on 5th January to develop a proposal for 3 aspiration centres to work in deprived communities on the Into University model – but with a greater focus on vocational routes to work - for a minimum of 5 years. This will necessitate significant match funding to be successful, however we believe it is achievable. We’re working closely with

key stakeholders, particularly ICE to ensure the centres fit within a wider CEIAG offer for Bradford.

3. Young Entrepreneurs – The School of Social Entrepreneurs will work with all 4 secondary schools in Keighley to deliver a programme to pupils around entrepreneurship and each school will develop a social enterprise that should continue to impact beyond this programme.
4. Youth grants – Grants to young people in Bradford working in partnership with an employer, academic institution or VCS to improve ELS and social mobility within the city. This is being delivered in partnership with Bradford Youth Service and the Youth Panels who currently deliver the Community Chests.

Priority 4 – using evidence based research to remove barriers to learning

- Action Research projects – Target: by 20/21 over 100 schools participating in educational research activity – 50 schools signed up
- Education Endowment Foundation EEF – EEF have agreed to fund the application 'joining up ophthalmic and school practice for reception year children with reduced vision (Glasses in Classes). 100 school RCT (50 control and 50 activate)
- Working with schools to train teachers, teaching assistants and SENCOs to deliver fine motor skill interventions to improve literacy rates at key stages 1 and 2. Preliminary results received and support to commence in September. Study has been picked up by national press, including a TES article.
- Developing forward look across wider areas to develop further potential Action Research Projects
- Bring in external Funding – Target: attract inwards investment of £1m by 20/21 Progress (complete)
- Funding provided for fine motor skills intervention through Education Endowment Foundation (EEF) for a large scale Randomised Control Trail (RCT)

Supplementary Question

Following on from that last answer could I ask that the Portfolio conveys this Council's congratulations to two headteachers in the city and in particular Mr Kneeshaw at Carlton Bolling who has shown that the presence of ethnic minority pupils is in no way related to the school's achievement which is outstanding and has been a beacon of excellence and can you pass on our thanks?

Councillor Imran Khan

Thank you for that Ralph. I would be more than happy to do that. You have probably seen today in the paper two schools, Kings and Carlton Bolling, both became world class schools added to the previous one which was Beckfoot in Bingley but if I can Lord Mayor also take this opportunity to congratulate Duncan Jacques from the Exceed Partnership as well on getting his CBE which shows that we have got some absolutely fantastic leaders in this district who are really doing us proud.

23. Councillor Andrew Senior

At a recent planning appeal a senior officer, accompanied by a legal representative were unable to answer questions. Neither could comment on the Core Strategy housing review, Bradford's plans to host new travellers' sites or even give the location of existing ones. Exasperated, the Inspector urged for Council representation back up, but none was available. Why were members of the public so badly represented by salaried Council professionals?

Answer

This appeal related to an application which was refused by the Bradford Area Planning Panel in August 2017. This was against officer's advice, which was to approve the application for a temporary period in line with a recent decision made by the National Planning Inspectorate for a similar scheme in another part of the district.

Unfortunately the original case officer dealing with the application had left the Council by the time of the appeal hearing and therefore a new case officer attended in his stead. To ensure all the necessary facts were available to the Inspector a robust Statement of Case had already been submitted to the Planning Inspectorate including the core strategy housing review on green belt and travellers sites and this contained much of the information the Planning Inspector asked for in the appeal meeting. This statement includes discussion of the locations of the two nearest traveller sites and discussed progress on the Council's Allocations Development Plan Document.

This information will be taken into account by the Planning Inspector in reaching a decision on this application.

Supplementary Question

Just a quick one. Does the first paragraph of the answer mean that or insinuate that if the Councillors go against the Council officers decisions we should offer no defence to their case and does it make a mockery of the appeals hearing with no defence being offered?

Councillor Alex Ross-Shaw

Absolutely not. It was never intended to mean that at all. Obviously when something goes to a Panel Members have every right to overturn an officer decision. They will take legal advice to make sure that is based in planning law to make sure it gives us the best chance of winning any appeal case. It is just stating out the facts just to provide a context that is all.

24. Councillor Ralph Berry

Does the Portfolio Holder share my anger and dismay at the government's latest cuts to Councils' public health grants which were bounced out just before Christmas?

Answer

Since its transfer to Local Authorities, Public Health has been subject to an annual reduction nationally to the Public Health Grant we receive. With the exception of 2015-16 (where the national reduction was 6.19%) the grant has been subject to a 2.3% -2.6% reduction year on year. The announcement of this cut in public health

comes at the same time as additional investment is announced in our NHS services.

Taking vital money away from the services which can be used to prevent illness thereby eliminating the need for treatment or care later down the line is extremely counterproductive. Cutting public health funding will undermine our efforts to keep people healthy and well and reduce pressure on our service and those of our partners. This would seem to reinforce a message that improving health and prevention are “nice to do” if you can, but not only is this a view we don’t support because it’s not sustainable to just keep responding to rising demand but we also have significant health and health inequalities challenges in Bradford that we must tackle to improve the health and wealth of the people of the Bradford District.

According to analysis by the Health Foundation, nationally there will have been a £0.7bn cut to the public health grant between 2014/15 and 2019/20, this equates to almost a quarter reduction in the spending per person. These cuts impact upon frontline public health services such as obesity programmes, drug and alcohol treatment, sexual health, health visitors and school nurses.

We were warned of these annual cuts to public health grants up to 2021 in 2015 so our Public Health team have already planned for this in the budget planning process, the announcement has just confirmed that the proposed cut will still happen.

Supplementary Question

Could I ask the Lead Member in this issue goes back to government and other relevant agencies to point out the massive contradiction of having a plan for the NHS who seeks to tackle health inequalities and takes preventative measures so that people live longer and healthier lives and then effectively slashing by 25% over this period the spending power of public health money which is spent in the very way that would produce those outcomes?

Councillor Sarah Feriby

Councillor Berry – yes. There is a strong message going back to government that services need proper and adequate funding and they are being told that on a regular basis and we will re-emphasise that yet again in the hopes that it will not fall on deaf ears. Unfortunately so far our calls and pleas are falling on deaf ears but we will continue to repeat those requests.

25. Councillor Kevin Warnes

How much has consideration of Northcliffe Park as a possible site for a new crematorium cost Bradford Council in terms of officer time and money?

Answer

The active pursuit of possible locations for replacement crematorium sites has been on-going for over four years; Northcliffe Park is one of approximately 40 sites to date that have been considered. Officer time devoted to revenue funded feasibility studies is not allocated against projects. The contract under which the external specialists have carried out preliminary work since November last year does not include specific costing for this individual activity. For officers to have to itemise every minute of their time broken down by each specific location under consideration, this would be a

hugely time-consuming if not impossible task which would not be conducive to getting the job done as efficiently as possible.

26. Councillor Ralph Berry

Can the Portfolio Holder outline ways in which Bradford Council can support the growing evidence of the effectiveness of peer mentor support work in the field of mental health and wellbeing?

Answer

Locally we have certainly shown that it works well in terms of an alternative way of delivering services. We work with partners to deliver peer mentor support across a range of services including mental health.

One of our partners, Kim Shutler Jones from the Cellar Trust, who specialise in Peer Mentor Support, was approached for a response:

Peer support workers are provided in the My Wellbeing College Enrolment Team so that the first contact is with someone with lived experience. Peer Support Wellbeing Coaches in My Wellbeing College delivering the guided self help telehealth service (new service)

Haven is a Peer Support Service which is award winning and delivered 2700 sessions of support in the past 12 months. 94% of attendees say that they would use the service again. 100% of those who have attended the crisis peer support groups have said that the groups have helped them to manage their crisis in the future.

Peer support working in A&E (winter pressures), we are part of a national research study called ENRICH which is a randomised control study into peer support, supporting discharge and preventing readmission. <http://imroc.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/06/5ImROC-Peer-Support-Workers-Theory-and-Practice.pdf>
So we are helping to build the evidence base.

The Cellar Trust is part of the national NHSE/HEE Steering Group on Peer Support as a new workforce within mental health (Chaired by Sarah Hughes the CEO of the Centre for Mental Health) as we have been recognised nationally for the work we have been doing in this area (particularly in terms of our integrated services).

We do not have robust evidence of this but one of the significant benefits of growing the peer support work force in the context of mental health is that it meets the needs around workforce issues. It is interesting to note that every time we recruit to peer support roles we are overwhelmed by a very high calibre of candidates. It seems to be an untapped workforce in terms of those who are passionate about MH but do not want to work in a statutory setting. Crucially we have built in a career pathway for our PSWs but there are more opportunities here to explore in the future. In this way it also links in well to our wider strategy around mental health and people returning to work.

27. Councillor John Pennington

It has taken the Council 4 months to declare that a £23m refurbishment of two City Centre railway stations must be delayed by a further ten months due to "insufficient

expertise” and a “shortage of resources” within Bradford Council. The business case cost has already increased by £110,000, why did it take so long to acknowledge our own shortcomings?

Answer

The recent Combined Authority paper (Capital Investment Programme) seeking approvals for an extension of time for delivery of the key station gateway upgrades of the West Yorkshire+ Transport Fund has been widely reported in local media over the Christmas and New Year period. Unfortunately the media interpretation of the information relating to these schemes is incorrect and does not truly reflect the activities of officers in bringing these projects forward.

It is absolutely commonplace and expected that for a major infrastructure project no Local Authority would have a pool of in-house expertise available to deliver such projects and therefore outside expertise would need to be brought in. This point was reiterated by senior WYCA officers at a recent Investment Committee meeting while approving the progress of other major infrastructure schemes across the region that will also utilise outside expertise.

In relation to the development of proposals for Forster Square station, following approval of the Outline Business Case by the Combined Authority the Council in late 2017 a comprehensive assessment of potential procurement and delivery strategies for the Arup Masterplan proposals was undertaken. The scope of this scheme involves both architectural, rail and highway engineering disciplines and has a complex interface with train operating companies and Network Rail as well as the adjacent offices and Valley Road retail park. An initial assessment of the potential options was presented to the Environment and Waste Overview & Scrutiny committee at its meeting of 23 January 2018.

Following completion of the assessment process a recommendation was subsequently presented to the same Committee at its meeting of 17 April 2018 seeking approval to procure the project through a Design and Build appointment. The report further sought approval for the development of such a design & build Invitation to Tender to be awarded to Costain Limited who would undertake development of the specification documents.

Since their appointment Costain have been working with the Council, Network Rail and our train operating company stakeholders to develop this document which we had envisaged being taken to market before Christmas. However, following the announcement of the Transforming Cities funding stream by central government the Council were asked by the Combined Authority to look at what additional elements could be incorporated in our proposals for both Forster Square and Bradford Interchange. Given the relatively advanced state of Forster Square proposals the possibility of using funding from the ‘short-term’ allocation of Transforming Cities was agreed with the Combined Authority. This necessitated a change to the Invitation to Tender documentation to allow additional elements of works to be brought into the project if funding through transforming cities was approved, consequently delaying the issue of the ITT to market. We now expect the ITT to be issued later this month.

In relation to improvements to Bradford Interchange the Council have procured a further masterplan study of interventions which could be deliverable in a pre-NPR future, together with invasive structural assessment surveys of the building fabric in order to determine the technical feasibility of their delivery. Funding from Transforming Cities is also to be sought later in 2019 which can be used to fund wider transformational interventions at the station.

Delivery of both these projects is moving apace and we are working closely with our colleagues in the Combined Authority to bring these projects to fruition at the earliest possible opportunity.

28. Councillor Alan Wainwright

With the Local Government Finance Settlement announced just before Christmas, can the Leader advise what the latest consultation on the “fair funding formula” reveals about Government’s thinking?

Answer

The Government released the latest consultation on the Fair Funding Review as part of the Provisional Local Government Finance Settlement on 13 December 2018. This follows on from the consultation which the Council responded to in March 2018. The Government state the consultation aims to:

- proposes to simplify the assessment of local authorities’ relative needs
- considers the type of adjustment that will be made to an authority’s relative needs assessment to take account of the relative resources available to them to fund local services
- proposes a set of principles that will be used to design potential transitional arrangements and examines how the baseline for the purposes of transition should be established.

My concern is that disadvantage will be diluted in the new formula with rurality and sparsity being more significant, favouring more uniquely rural counties. Officers are currently working through the implications for Bradford of the consultation documentation with the intention of submitting a response by the deadline of 21 February 2019. Of what I have seen so far, it is true to say that whilst Children’s and Adults services include deprivation as a factor, general Council services do not include such an indicator which is concerning. My overarching concern is that the Funding Review will “rob Peter to pay for Paul” i.e. further cut disadvantaged urban budgets in favour of more affluent county areas.

29. Councillor Cath Bacon

Does the Leader share my severe concern about the latest analysis of DWP data which has found that the vast majority of people being penalised by the government’s benefit cap are single mothers?

Answer

I do share your concern.

We have been aware since the Benefits Cap was first introduced in 2013 that lone parents have been impacted more than other households. Whilst this isn't something that is unique to our district, it is certainly a cause for concern.

The cap is applied by the local authority to Housing Benefit claims, on behalf of the DWP, but as capped households transfer to Universal Credit, it will be applied to their new benefit.

We will continue to oppose the Government's welfare cuts, although this will do little to support those currently affected. For our part, we revised our Discretionary Housing Payments scheme in March 2018, which can be used to help mitigate the impact of the cap, to give greater priority to families and since then almost half of all awards have been made to families with children.

30. Councillor Riaz Ahmed

Can the Portfolio Holder provide details of the work to date to deliver a railway station at Laisterdyke providing where possible estimated costs, funding sources and timescales?

Answer

Proposals referred to in this question for a station at Laisterdyke form part of the emerging Leeds City Region Connectivity Strategy's proposals for a potential mass-transit network which was reported to Executive in December 2018. The mass-transit proposal is one of a range of interventions which builds on existing connectivity priorities for each West Yorkshire district and develops the first tranche of Inclusive Growth Corridors (those areas with greatest economic need / opportunity) as identified in the Leeds City Region HS2 Growth Strategy.

As the strategy presented to Executive is the 'start of the conversation' on potential intervention proposals with stakeholders across West Yorkshire it is not possible to provide any further detail on costs, funding sources or timescales for delivery although the ambition is for a mass transit system to be in place by the time HS2 and Northern Powerhouse Rail start in the 2030s.

31. Councillor Aneela Ahmed

The LGA has said adult social care services face a £3.5bn funding gap by 2025 due to government cuts and rising demand. Can the Portfolio Holder set out how we are working to improve the quality of social care for vulnerable adults despite these huge challenges?

Answer

The local authority is working on a specific number of developments in order to manage demand by responding differently to maximise the independence of people, which often leads to preventing the need for ongoing support and reducing the cost of the time that is needed.

Early help and prevention means that we work with people before they need more traditional and costly care. As we know if we delay involvement people are more

likely to go into crisis which is damaging to them and their families and ultimately more costly.

We have introduced small budgets so we can effectively and quickly do the right things to help people stay or get home. Our community led social work is embracing a strength based and personalised approach connected to localities. It has evidenced that people are happier with this outcome, have less need for ongoing support and it is cost effective.

This approach has also been adopted by our front door team "Access" which in their first week saw a 6% reduction in those people needing full assessment but also fewer people merely being signposted elsewhere.

We are working with a number of community and voluntary sector groups to listen to the voices of people who use our services and we are hearing how people often don't want or need the traditional types of services but recognise that people have the right to be happy and fulfilled. This in turn will be reflected in our commissioning and we will change our response in order to reflect these big conversations.

We have developed more personalised responses so when a person has an ongoing need they can opt for a direct payment – where they or their nominated family member has a personal budget, for the greatest choice and control.

People can have an ISF (Individual Service Fund), which is a legal three-way agreement by which the person can choose but the money can be paid directly to the agency which relieves a lot of anxiety for people.

We are working on improving the quality of our long term provision so that people can more routinely have a positive experience of long term care.

Finally we are doing this by working with our colleagues in health to ensure smooth transitions and we continue to do well in preventing people staying in hospital unnecessarily.

In spite of all our efforts, I repeat our call to Government that there needs to be an urgent sustainable funding stream to support adult social care in Councils. This is a call being made repeatedly by all Councils, regardless of political persuasion.

32. Councillor Val Townend

Given that it has been claimed that lives are being put at risk by a third of unsafe taxis on the district's roads failing basic safety tests, can the Leader of the Council explain what measures have been taken to rectify this problem and when does she anticipate that all vehicles will be road-worthy?

Answer

The failure rate for stringent vehicle safety inspections has reduced to around 30% from a level previously around 40%. This follows various actions taken by Council officers including increasing the accountability of operators for vehicles they despatch and increasing retest fees for vehicles failing on safety grounds. The

current failure rate is 28%, of which 16% is for minor defects and 12% for more serious faults. As a comparator, the UK average MOT failure rate for private cars is 35.40%.

Education and enforcement activities to support further improvements are on-going and 2019 will see the start of vehicle operators being rated in a similar way to food outlets (a 5 star rating) with vehicle safety being an integral part of achieving a high star rating.

I would like to stress that the vast majority of taxis provide a safe and valued service to the public of Bradford District. We are committed to working constructively with operators in striving for the highest possible standards.

Supplementary Question

I would like to thank you for the response and I am very pleased that the current failure rate for the safe taxis has now been reduced to 16% for minor defects and 12% for more serious defects. When do you anticipate that all vehicles will be roadworthy? I am very concerned about the safeguarding of all the residents of Bradford when travelling in taxis and I feel you should prioritise this issue before any Bradford residents are involved in accidents as a result of travelling in unsafe vehicles.

Councillor Sarah Ferriby

When you refer to unroadworthy a number of the faults and the stats that you have been looking at are due to minor failures so they are still roadworthy vehicles. Work is ongoing with the trade as always and the trade are improving, getting faults seen to so we are seeing a reduction in those faults. Work is ongoing but the majority of the trade all have a regular dialogue with the service. They know the direction of travel. These are in instance mainly minor faults and vehicles are roadworthy. If they were not roadworthy they would not be allowed on the road.

33. Councillor Angela Tait

Can the Portfolio Holder for healthy people and places tell us what events and activities we have to look forward to in 2019 to boost tourism in our district?

Answer

It's taking shape to be a superb year for events across the Bradford District in 2019. There are too many to mention individually here which is a nice problem to have, but nevertheless here's a taster of just some of the events we can all look forward to which we will enjoy as residents but which will also undoubtedly attract large numbers of visitors into the district and showcase it on a national and international stage.

The Yorkshire Games Festival will return to the National Science and Media Museum on 6-10 February, celebrating games culture, design and production with special guests, workshops and master classes. Gaming has obviously grown into a massive leisure activity but it's also worth noting the economic benefits, with more than 9% of the UK games industry based here in Yorkshire and the Humber.

There's a great event for young families on 20-21 February at Keighley and Worth Valley Railway when children can get to meet Chase & Marshall from Paw Patrol. And looking ahead to 8-10 March there's something for all ages there with the three-day festival of steam.

As ever, this year there are some fantastic events to look forward to in Haworth whose famous cobbles will be on show to all the world when the Tour de Yorkshire passes through on 5 May. There is the legendary 1940s weekend later that month, with music, dancing and entertainment on 18-19 May. In June, there is the Haworth 60s Weekend on 22-23 June. And then looking ahead to the autumn, there's the Haworth Steampunk Weekend on 11-13 October which is always a great spectacle.

Over at Cartwright Hall there's a lovely new exhibition opening on 18 May and running until 8 September, which will feature rarely seen original illustrations and early manuscripts by Beatrix Potter from The Tale of Peter Rabbit.

Speaking of art, the brilliant Saltaire Arts Trail is back on 25-27 May which always offers something for everyone. Then across in Roberts Park on 21-23 June we have the dragonboat festival, which has truly gone from strength to strength and has proved a great success, not only as a family day out but also in raising big sums for worthy causes.

Then on 28 June the award winning Bradford Literature Festival is back, running this year until 7 July with its packed schedule of over 300 events drawing high profile guests to celebrate the written and spoken word in all its forms. Bradford Festival comes to City Park on 12-14 July, Bradford Science Festival comes to the National Science and Media Museum on 18-21 July, the Keighley Show takes place on 7 September and the prestigious Ilkley Literature Festival is 4-20 October this year.

In among all that, we of course have various events across all corners of the district, not least the top-class cycling which I've talked about in the answer to question 14.

These are just a few of the highlights, but please note the Council publishes event listings for the district online at <https://www.visitbradford.com/events.aspx> and the information we hold on smaller community events can be found at <https://whatson.bradford.gov.uk/>.

34. Councillor Rizwana Jamil

Can the Portfolio Holder tell us how much household recycling we achieve as a district, what are the challenges and are we heading in the right direction?

Answer

The Council this year expects to collect 32,936 tonnes of recyclates at the kerbside compared to 14,102 tonnes in 2013. Contamination levels which were at 40% following the introduction of Alternate Week Collections (AWC) are now at 27%. This has resulted in a reduction of tonnages being sent to our main contractor as residual waste which has therefore reduced our overall residual disposal costs. Work is on-going to address areas that are showing high levels of contamination in its recyclates and results from the work done in Fagley and Ravenscliffe have been very

encouraging as their contamination levels have reduced from 40% and 37% to 23% and 24% respectively.

Supplementary Question

Thank you for the answer Portfolio Holder. One of the challenges in this area is around education and as I understand we are encouraging people to volunteer as recycling champions. Can I have reassurance that volunteers from a diverse background representing the communities we represent which would benefit from such intervention and education are particularly encouraged and recruited to further decrease our contamination levels?

Councillor Sarah Feriby

Thank you Councillor Jamil. Yes there has been a call across all the districts for volunteers and we are finding that we are getting an even uptake of volunteers who come in and have some training. We go through a number of things with them and they have a leading event and Councillor Davies attended one of those. They were well attended and we are still pushing to increase the number of volunteers across our communities across the district.

35. Councillor John Pennington

Could the Leader of the Council confirm why the residents of static caravans have to vacate for a period each year, when they pay Council Tax?

Answer

Although each site will have slightly different circumstances, the reason for residents having to vacate for a period of time is due to planning conditions. Generally sites have been given permission for the siting of touring and static seasonal caravans , with variations to the conditions being added subsequently to permit holiday use of existing static caravans for 11 months of the year (with closure during February). The reason for this condition is to prevent the establishment of permanent residential occupancy on the land, which would be contrary to the Council's adopted green belt policy.

In cases where the site owner has effectively allowed people to live there permanently, albeit with the requirement to vacate for a month, the caravan has to be treated for Council Tax purposes as their sole or main residence. However, because of this requirement to vacate for a month the residents are able to claim a discount for the period they cannot be resident. We ask that the residents make an application for this exemption after they have returned to the property.

36. Councillor Geoff Reid

Can the Portfolio Holder explain why are there still no street lights on Tunwell Street, Eccleshill to replace the two that were removed by the developer?

Answer

The Council was informed that the lighting had been removed by a member of the public. Upon investigation it was established that there were two columns that had been removed without permission after the electricity main through the site had been

disconnected, also disconnecting the two columns plus another one. We have been unable to get a response from the developer regarding their actions although Northern Powergrid has said that they will re-service the remaining column and also that they will connect the two missing columns if the Council installs them. The Street Lighting service will arrange for this to happen and we will record the costs which will be pursued via enforcement/legal action.

Supplementary Question

I congratulate the Portfolio Holder for the clearest account that I have seen so far on this miserable sequence of events. It will be of interest both to residents who have been struggling to find their way down their own street and indeed to members of the Conservative Club who have given up using the snicket at the end and have to go the long way round home. The answer makes it clear that the lights will be connected on the missing columns if the Council installs them and if I understand the last sentence right this will happen. In the light of this does the Portfolio Holder share my disappointment that it has taken so long to get to this point and can he indicate the timetable for restoring proper lighting to Tunwell Street.

Councillor Alex Ross-Shaw

For a minute I thought it was all just going to be nice and I was going to accept it but thank you for the congratulations. I will get a timetable to you. Obviously what we try to do in these situations is exhaust every option before we go down a route where we will have to enforce because that can be a lengthy process in itself. I will try and get a timetable to you.

37. Councillor Nazam Azam

Will the Portfolio Holder give an update on the Council's latest activities to support community cohesion in Bradford District?

Answer

The District's Stronger Communities Partnership recently developed a five year strategy that details activities that promote community cohesion, social mixing and integration. This was informed by a consultation exercise carried out last summer which involved speaking with over 630 residents from across Bradford district. A two delivery plan has been developed that is being funded by the Ministry for Housing Communities and Local Government as part of Bradford's designation as one of five 'Integrated Communities Pilot Areas'. Year one funding of £1.2 million has been provided by the MHCLG which will allow the district to try out new initiatives and look at scaling up existing ones, such as the nationally acclaimed School Linking Network to extend this across more schools and also involve parent linking opportunities. Information on the money that will be made available for the second year is expected later this month.

Bradford has a strong track record in this area based on many years work bringing different communities together.

The Council funds Community Action Bradford and Airedale to support the voluntary sector and provide 'voice and influence' to some of our smaller and under represented groups.

Through £1.3 million of funding provided by the Controlling Migration Fund projects have taken place that promote cohesion amongst people living across our district and to support the orientation for new arrivals to help them more quickly acclimatise to live in the district, supporting their integration.

For the last two years the Council has run a small grants programme as part of the Jo Cox Foundation 'Great get Together' which helps communities come together over the summer through small events and community picnics etc. Over 100 applications have been received for events this year. A similar scheme has taken place connecting faith organisations and the Council promotes the 'Visit my Mosque' initiative, which will take place in March this year.

Our Children's Services department runs a range of activities with schools. Of particular note is the Stand Up, Speak Out Make A Difference (SUSOMAD). This project sends roaming exhibitions about the Holocaust and the Srebrenica genocide to visit schools around Bradford. The exhibition promotes British values and equality, challenges intolerance and extremism, contributes to SMSC development and promotes positive relationships between people from different backgrounds and circumstances. SUSOMAD Ambassadors support the workshops by guiding school groups around the exhibition using their peer education skills.

Our successful People Can initiative is an open invitation to our communities, neighbourhoods, villages, towns, individuals and organisations that make up the district to work together - through community action and volunteering to improve neighbourhoods through clean ups, becoming 'Friends of' parks and generally being neighbourly in their approach to solving local problems. Our annual 'Community Stars' delivered in partnership with the Telegraph and Argus and other sponsors is always an amazing celebration of our districts active citizens and with the support of the T&A allows the district to showcase the great work that is taking place from people across our diverse communities.

Council officers also work with communities to support a variety of events that celebrate different communities and bring people together. Events like the amazing 'Illuminate' in December; Christmas Lights switch on across the district, Remembrance Sunday commemorative events bring our communities together. Other events over the last year these have included Refugee Week, Windrush, Black History Month, Holocaust Memorial Day, Believing in Bradford and various faith tours. The Council also supports larger events and festivals such as the Bradford Literature Festival, where diverse programming provides opportunities to bring people together and learn from different cultures.

Finally, and perhaps an area that we often overlook is the spaces and places that the Council manages which bring people together, not least our wonderful City Park, where on a sunny afternoon it is possible to see the whole of our district represented, sitting, chatting and playing together in and around the mirror pool.

38. Councillor Andrew Senior

Could the Portfolio Holder for Environment, Sport and Culture confirm whether we have the result on the review of the outdoor sports fields on the new Low Moor site- in the full Council meeting it was highlighted?

Answer

The playing pitch strategy review for the district is still on-going and will be published in Spring 2019. Based on previous data however, and with the development of a new All Weather Pitch at Wyke Manor there is sufficient provision of All Weather Pitches in this area of the District. There is however a shortfall of good quality, well drained grass pitch provision which will be a key feature of the new Sedbergh development.

39. Councillor Tess Peart

Will the Portfolio Holder tell us how we work with partners to deliver more affordable housing in the district?

Answer

The Council works collaboratively and creatively with partners and stakeholders to explore different ways to support and encourage the delivery of affordable housing in the District and to ensure new homes are of the right type and location to meet need. The Council is also a major contributor to the delivery of affordable homes with 160 new affordable homes currently on site and to be completed by the summer 2019.

The Bradford Housing Partnership, led by the Council, is well established and brings together a range of partners to deliver the District's Housing and Homelessness Strategy. Through this forum, priorities are identified and outcomes are monitored and reviewed. One of the key outcomes of the strategy is to ensure there is an adequate supply of affordable homes to buy or rent; this priority is overseen by the Housing Place Group which meets on a quarterly basis and its membership includes representatives from Homes England and Registered Providers (RPs) operating in the District.

In 2017-18, 334 affordable homes were delivered in the District. This is the highest level of affordable homes delivery in the last 3 years; with 184 in 2016-17 and 92 in 2015-16. Affordable housing is largely delivered directly by the Council or Registered Providers (RPs) but also through Section 106 agreements whereby the Local Planning Authority requires a developer, through the planning process, to deliver a proportion of affordable homes on development site.

The Council is currently developing a Housing Delivery Plan which will set out how we will enable and stimulate the delivery of housing. Key activities include:

- a dedicated, multi-disciplinary team of officers who provide a pool of housing development knowledge and intelligence;
- enabling new developments on Council-owned land thereby supporting a range of policy priorities such as increasing affordable housing or building homes to meet the needs of a particular client group such as older people.
- practical interventions such as brokering discussions between partners;

exploring opportunities to fast-track schemes and maximising funding streams to help bring schemes into financial viability .

- exploring joint venture opportunities with development partners in order to accelerate housing developments (such as Canal Road Urban Village Ltd (CRUVL)).