



# Audit Completion Report

West Yorkshire Pension Fund

Year ending 31 March 2018



West Yorkshire Pension Fund

 M A Z A R S

# CONTENTS

1. Executive summary
2. Financial statements audit
3. Internal control recommendations
4. Summary of misstatements

Appendix A – Draft management representation letter

Appendix B – Draft audit report

Appendix C – Draft consistency report

Appendix D – Independence

Our reports are prepared in the context of the 'Statement of responsibilities of auditors and audited bodies' and the 'Terms of Appointment' issued by Public Sector Audit Appointments Limited.

Reports and letters prepared by appointed auditors and addressed to the Pension Fund are prepared for the sole use of the Pension Fund and we take no responsibility to any member or officer in their individual capacity or to any third party.

Mazars LLP is the UK firm of Mazars, an international advisory and accountancy group. Mazars LLP is registered by the Institute of Chartered Accountants in England and Wales.

Members of the Governance & Audit Committee  
City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council  
City Hall  
Centenary Square  
Bradford  
BD1 1HY

30<sup>th</sup> July 2018

Dear Members

**Audit Completion Report – Year ended 31 March 2018**

We are pleased to present our Audit Completion Report for the year ended 31 March 2018. The purpose of this document is to summarise our audit conclusions.

The scope of our work, including identified significant audit risks, key audit matters and other areas of management judgement, was outlined in our Audit Strategy Memorandum which we presented on 22<sup>nd</sup> March 2018. We have reviewed our Audit Strategy Memorandum and concluded that the original significant audit risks, key audit matters and other areas of management judgement remain appropriate.

We would like to express our thanks for the assistance of your team during our audit.

If you would like to discuss any matters in more detail then please do not hesitate to contact me on 01913836300.

Yours faithfully

Signed: {{\_es\_:signer1:signature }}

Mark Kirkham  
Partner  
Mazars LLP

# 1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

## Purpose of this report and principal conclusions

The Audit Completion Report sets out the findings from our audit of the West Yorkshire Pension Fund for the year ended 31 March 2018, and forms the basis for discussion at the Governance & Audit Committee meeting on 30<sup>th</sup> July 2018.

The detailed scope of our work as your appointed auditor for 2017/18 is set out in the National Audit Office's (NAO) Code of Audit Practice. Our responsibilities and powers are derived from the Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014.

Sections 2 of this report outlines the detailed findings from our work on the financial statements. As we outline on the following page, our work is substantially complete and, subject to the satisfactory completion of the outstanding work, at the time of issuing this report we have the following conclusions:

### Opinion on the financial statements

We anticipate issuing an unqualified opinion, without modification, on the financial statements. Our proposed audit opinion is included in the draft auditor's report in Appendix B.

### Consistency Report

We anticipate concluding that the Pension Fund financial statements within the Pension Fund's Annual report are consistent with Pension Fund financial statements with the Statement of Accounts of the Council. Our draft consistency report is provided in Appendix C.

### Wider powers

The 2014 Act requires us to give an elector, or any representative of the elector, the opportunity to question us about the accounting records of the Pension Fund and to consider any objection made to the accounts.

## Misstatements and internal control recommendations

Section 3 sets out the internal control recommendations that we make, together with an update on any prior year recommendations.

Section 4 outlines the misstatements noted as part of our audit as at the time of issuing this report.

# 1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

## Status of our audit work

We have substantially completed our work on the financial statements of the year ended 31 March 2018. At the time of preparing this report the following matters remain outstanding:

Audit area	Description of outstanding matters
Consistency opinion	We have not yet received the revised annual report and have not therefore undertaken a comparison between the revised Pension Fund financial statements within the Statement of Accounts of the Council with the revised Pension Fund financial statements within the Pension Fund's Annual Report.
Current Assets	We are waiting for bank confirmation of a bank transfer where one side of the transaction occurred prior to the year end, and the other side occurred after the year end.
IAS19 Assurance	The audit of the cashflow information submitted to the actuary is ongoing.
Closure procedures and review	We will complete our standard closure procedures, including review of the amended financial statements and consideration of post balance sheet events.

We will provide the Audit Committee with an update in relation to these outstanding matters in a follow-up letter, prior to signing the auditor's report.

## Our audit approach

We provided details of our intended audit approach in our Audit Strategy Memorandum in March 2018. We have not made any changes to our audit approach since we presented our Audit Strategy Memorandum.

## Materiality

We set overall materiality at the planning stage of the audit at £140.4m using a benchmark of 1% of net assets available to pay benefits. We set a specific materiality for the fund account of £50m using a benchmark of 10% of contributions receivable. Our final assessment of overall materiality, based on the final financial statements is £135.6m, and our final specific materiality for the fund account is £50.8m, using the same benchmarks. We set our trivial threshold (the level under which individual errors are not communicated to the Audit Committee) at £4m based on 3% of overall materiality.



## 2. FINANCIAL STATEMENTS AUDIT

Set out below are the significant findings from our audit. These findings include:

- our findings on key audit matters, including:
  - why the matter was considered to be one of the most significance in the audit and therefore determined to be a key audit matter;
  - how the matter was addressed in the audit including a summary of our response;
  - where relevant, key observations arising with respect to each matter; and
  - a clear reference to the relevant disclosures in the financial statements
- our audit conclusions regarding significant risks and key areas of management judgement outlined in the Audit Strategy Memorandum;
- our comments in respect of the accounting policies and disclosures that you have adopted in the financial statements. On page 7 we have concluded whether the financial statements have been prepared in accordance with the financial reporting framework and commented on any significant accounting policy changes that have been made during the year;
- any significant difficulties we experienced during the audit; and

### Significant risks and key areas of management judgement

As part of our planning procedures we considered the risks of material misstatement in the Fund's financial statements that required special audit consideration. Although we report identified key audit matters and significant risks at the planning stage of the audit in our Audit Strategy Memorandum, our risk assessment is a continuous process and we regularly consider whether new key audit matters and significant risks have arisen and how we intend to respond to these risks. No new risks have been identified since we issued our Audit Strategy Memorandum.

#### Significant risk

Management override of controls

#### Description of the risk

In all entities, management at various levels within an organisation are in a unique position to perpetrate fraud because of their ability to manipulate accounting records and prepare fraudulent financial statements by overriding controls that otherwise appear to be operating effectively. Because of the unpredictable way in which such override could occur, we consider there to be a risk of material misstatement due to fraud and thus a significant risk on all audits.

#### How we addressed this risk

We addressed this risk by performing audit work in the following areas:

- accounting estimates impacting on amounts included in the financial statements;
- consideration of identified significant transactions outside the normal course of business; and
- journals recorded in the general ledger and other adjustments made in preparation of the financial statements.

#### Audit conclusion

Based on work completed to date, our work has provided us with the assurance we sought and has not highlighted any material issues to bring to your attention.

## 2. FINANCIAL STATEMENTS AUDIT (CONTINUED)

### Significant risk

Valuation of unquoted investments for which a market price is not readily available

### Description of the risk

As at 31 March 2018, the fair value of investments which were not quoted on an active market was £1.9bn, which accounted for 13.6% of the Fund's net investment assets. As prices for these investments are not quoted in active markets, the values used in the accounts are those provided by fund managers. This is mostly based on Net Asset Value statements. This results in an increased risk of material misstatement.

### How we addressed this risk

In addition to our standard programme of work in this area we have:

- agreed the valuation to supporting documentation including investment manager valuation statements and cash flows for any adjustments made to the investment manager valuation;
- agreed the investment manager valuation to audited accounts. Where these were not available, we agreed the investment manager valuation to other independent supporting documentation;
- where audited accounts were available, we checked that they were supported by a clear opinion; and
- where available, we reviewed any independent control assurance reports and confirm that they do not highlight any risks of material misstatement

### Audit conclusion

Our work has provided the assurance we sought and has not highlighted any material issues to bring to your attention.

### Key areas of management judgement

Key areas of management judgement include accounting estimates which are material but are not considered to give rise to a significant risk of material misstatement. We have not identified any such judgements.

An amendment has been made to the accounts for the estimated transfer value payable to Greater Manchester Pension Fund in relation to First West Yorkshire. While this estimate is material it is not considered to give rise to a significant risk of misstatement..

## 2. FINANCIAL STATEMENTS AUDIT (CONTINUED)

### Qualitative aspects of the entity's accounting practices

We have reviewed the Pension Fund's accounting policies and disclosures and concluded they comply with the requirements of the Code of Practice on Local Authority Accounting (the Code), appropriately tailored to the Pension Fund's circumstances.

Draft accounts were received from the Pension Fund on 31 May 2018 and were of a good quality.

### Significant difficulties during the audit

During the course of the audit we did not encounter any significant difficulties and we have had the full co-operation of management.

### Wider responsibilities

Our powers and responsibilities under the 2014 Act are broad and include the ability to:

- issue a report in the public interest;
- make statutory recommendations that must be considered and responded to publicly;
- apply to the court for a declaration that an item of account is contrary to law; and
- issue an advisory notice under schedule 8 of the 2014 Act.

We have not exercised any of these powers as part of our 2017/18 audit.

The 2014 Act also gives rights to local electors and other parties, such as the right to ask questions of the auditor and the right to make an objection to an item of account.



# 3. INTERNAL CONTROL RECOMMENDATIONS

The purpose of our audit is to express an opinion on the financial statements. As part of our audit we have considered the internal controls in place relevant to the preparation of the financial statements. We do this in order to design audit procedures to allow us to express an opinion on the financial statement and not for the purpose of expressing an opinion on the effectiveness of internal control, nor to identify any significant deficiencies in their design or operation.

The matters reported are limited to those deficiencies and other control recommendations that we have identified during our normal audit procedures and that we consider to be of sufficient importance to merit being reported. If we had performed more extensive procedures on internal control we might have identified more deficiencies to be reported or concluded that some of the reported deficiencies need not in fact have been reported. Our comments should not be regarded as a comprehensive record of all deficiencies that may exist or improvements that could be made.

Our findings and recommendations are set out below. We have assigned priority rankings to each of them to reflect the importance that we consider each poses to your organisation and, hence, our recommendation in terms of the urgency of required action. In summary, the matters arising fall into the following categories:

Priority ranking	Description	Number of issues
<b>1 (high)</b>	In our view, there is potential for financial loss, damage to reputation or loss of information. This may have implications for the achievement of business strategic objectives. The recommendation should be taken into consideration by management immediately.	0
<b>2 (medium)</b>	In our view, there is a need to strengthen internal control or enhance business efficiency. The recommendations should be actioned in the near future.	0
<b>3 (low)</b>	In our view, internal control should be strengthened in these additional areas when practicable.	1

### 3. INTERNAL CONTROL RECOMMENDATIONS (CONTINUED)

#### Other deficiencies in internal control – Level 3

##### Description of deficiency

As part of the audit, we identified that there were a number journals, albeit a small percentage of total journals, containing no narrative description.

---

##### Potential effects

The exclusion of a narrative description makes it more difficult to determine the reason for a journal posting. This increases the risk for fraudulent activity being undetected.

---

##### Recommendation

It is recommended that journals are regularly reviewed to ensure that reasonable journal descriptions are included for all posted entries.

---

##### Management response

Officers have reviewed journals and retrained the relevant staff to ensure that a narrative description is included for all journals.

---

## 4. SUMMARY OF MISSTATEMENTS

We set out below the misstatements identified for adjustment during the course of the audit, above the level of trivial threshold of £4m.

The first table outlines the misstatements that were identified during the course of our audit which management has assessed as not being material either individually or in aggregate to the financial statements and does not currently plan to adjust.

The second table outlines the misstatements that have been adjusted by management during the course of the audit.

### Unadjusted misstatements 2017/18

	Fund Account		Net Assets Statement	
	Dr (£m)	Cr (£m)	Dr (£m)	Cr (£m)
1 Dr: Investment Assets			36.385	
Cr: Profit and losses on disposal of and changes in the market value of investments		36.385		

This is the extrapolate difference between the fair value of unquoted investments included within the accounts compared to the fair value provided at the time of audit, due to more up to date information available at the time of audit. The actual difference on the sampled items was £16.780m.

### Adjusted misstatements 2017/18

	Fund Account		Net Assets Statement	
	Dr (£m)	Cr (£m)	Dr (£m)	Cr (£m)
1 Dr: Payments to and on account of leavers	300.000			
Cr: Current liabilities		300.000		

This is the accrued liability in relation to the bulk transfer of first west Yorkshire members to Greater Manchester Pension Fund during the year. It is noted that a review of the estimated accrual identified a non-trivial, non-material difference in the calculation of the liability.

This amendment has also resulted in amendment to the corresponding notes to the accounts; Note 10 Payments to and on accounts of leavers, Note 18 Fair value, Note 19 Financial instruments, and Note 21 Current liabilities.

### Disclosure amendments

The following disclosure amendments were made:

**Note 3, Accounting Policies – Transfers in or out of the Fund:** This policy has been updated to state that bulk transfers are accounted for on an accruals basis.

**Note 17b, Stock Lending:** Stock on loan has been amended to show figures in billions to 1dp in the final accounts, rather than shown as millions to 3dp as in the draft accounts.

**General:** A number of other changes have been made to the financial statements not requiring individual analysis.

# APPENDIX A

## DRAFT MANAGEMENT REPRESENTATION LETTER

Mazars LLP  
Mazars House  
Gelderd Road  
Leeds  
LS27 7JN

July 2018

Dear Mark

### West Yorkshire Pension Fund - audit for year ended 31 March 2018

This representation letter is provided in connection with your audit of the financial statements of the West Yorkshire Pension Fund ('the Pension Fund') for the year ended 31 March 2018 for the purpose of expressing an opinion as to whether the financial statements give a true and fair view in accordance with the CIPFA/LASAAC Code of Practice on Local Authority Accounting in the United Kingdom 2017/18 (the Code).

I confirm that the following representations are made on the basis of enquiries of management and staff with relevant knowledge and experience (and, where appropriate, inspection of supporting documentation) sufficient to satisfy ourselves that I can properly make each of the following representations to you.

### My responsibility for the financial statements and accounting information

I believe that I have fulfilled my responsibilities for the true and fair presentation and preparation of the financial statements in accordance with the Code.

### My responsibility to provide and disclose relevant information

I have provided you with:

- access to all information of which we are aware that is relevant to the preparation of the financial statements such as records, documentation and other material;
- additional information that you have requested from us for the purpose of the audit; and
- unrestricted access to individuals within the Pension Fund you determined it was necessary to contact in order to obtain audit evidence.

I confirm as Assistant Director – Finance and Procurement that I have taken all the necessary steps to make me aware of any relevant audit information and to establish that you, as auditors, are aware of this information.

As far as I am aware there is no relevant audit information of which you, as auditors, are unaware.

### Accounting records

I confirm that all transactions that have a material affect on the financial statements have been recorded in the accounting records and are reflected in the financial statements. All other records and related information, including minutes of all Pension Fund and Committee meetings, have been made available to you.

### Accounting policies

I confirm that I have reviewed the accounting policies applied during the year in accordance with the Code and International Accounting Standard 8 and consider these policies to faithfully represent the effects of transactions, other events or conditions on the Pension Fund's financial position, financial performance and cash flows.

### Accounting estimates, including those measured at fair value

I confirm that any significant assumptions used by the Pension Fund in making accounting estimates, including those measured at fair value, are reasonable.

### Contingencies

There are no material contingent losses including pending or potential litigation that should be accrued where:

- information presently available indicates that it is probable that an asset has been impaired or a liability had been incurred at the balance sheet date; and
- the amount of the loss can be reasonably estimated.

There are no material contingent losses that should be disclosed where, although either or both the conditions specified above are not met, there is a reasonable possibility that a loss, or a loss greater than that accrued, may have been incurred at the balance sheet date.

Executive summary

Significant findings

Internal control  
recommendations

Summary of misstatements

Appendices

# APPENDIX A

## DRAFT MANAGEMENT REPRESENTATION LETTER

### (CONTINUED)

#### Contingencies - continued

There are no contingent gains which should be disclosed.

All material matters, including unasserted claims, that may result in litigation against the Pension Fund have been brought to your attention. All known actual or possible litigation and claims whose effects should be considered when preparing the financial statements have been disclosed to you and accounted for and disclosed in accordance with the Code.

#### Laws and regulations

I confirm that I have disclosed to you all those events of which I am aware which involve known or suspected non-compliance with laws and regulations, together with the actual or contingent consequences which may arise therefrom. The Pension Fund has complied with all aspects of contractual agreements that would have a material effect on the accounts in the event of non-compliance.

#### Fraud and error

I acknowledge my responsibility as Assistant Director – Finance and Procurement for the design, implementation and maintenance of internal control to prevent and detect fraud and error. I have disclosed to you:

- all the results of my assessment of the risk that the financial statements may be materially misstated as a result of fraud;
- all knowledge of fraud or suspected fraud affecting the Pension Fund involving:
  - management and those charged with governance;
  - employees who have significant roles in internal control; and
  - others where fraud could have a material effect on the financial statements.

I have disclosed to you all information in relation to any allegations of fraud, or suspected fraud, affecting the Pension Fund's statement of accounts communicated by employees, former employees, analysts, regulators or others.

#### Assets

I confirm that all assets held are free from liens, charges or any other encumbrance.

#### Related party transactions

I confirm that all related party relationships, transactions and balances have been appropriately accounted for and disclosed in accordance with the requirements of the Code.

I have disclosed to you the identity of the Pension Fund's related parties and all related party relationships and transactions of which I am aware.

#### Future commitments

I am not aware of any plans, intentions or commitments that may materially affect the carrying value or classification of assets and liabilities or give rise to additional liabilities.

#### Subsequent events

I confirm all events subsequent to the date of the financial statements and for which the Code requires adjustment or disclosure have been adjusted or disclosed. Should further material events occur after the date of this letter which may necessitate revision of the figures included in the financial statements or inclusion of a note thereto, I will advise you accordingly.

#### Going concern

To the best of my knowledge there is nothing to indicate that the Pension Fund will not continue as a going concern in the foreseeable future. The period to which I have paid particular attention in assessing the appropriateness of the going concern basis is not less than twelve months from the date of approval of the accounts.

Yours sincerely

Assistant Director – Finance and Procurement

Date.....

Executive summary

Significant findings

Internal control  
recommendations

Summary of misstatements

Appendices

# APPENDIX B

## DRAFT AUDITOR'S REPORT

### Independent auditor's report to the Members of the City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council

#### Opinion on the Council's financial statements

We have audited the financial statements of the City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council ('the Council') for the year ended 31 March 2018 under the Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014. The financial statements comprise the Movement in Reserves Statement, the Comprehensive Income and Expenditure Statement, the Balance Sheet, the Cash Flow Statement, the Collection Fund and notes to the financial statements, including the summary of significant accounting policies. The financial reporting framework that has been applied in their preparation is applicable law and the CIPFA/LASAAC Code of Practice on Local Authority Accounting in the United Kingdom 2017/18.

In our opinion the financial statements:

- give a true and fair view of the financial position of the City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council as at 31 March 2018 and of its expenditure and income for the year then ended; and
- have been prepared properly in accordance with the CIPFA/LASAAC Code of Practice on Local Authority Accounting in the United Kingdom 2017/18.

#### Opinion on the Pension Fund financial statements

We have audited the financial statements of West Yorkshire Pension Fund for the year ended 31 March 2018 under the Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014. The Pension Fund financial statements comprise the Fund Account, the Net Assets Statement and the related notes, including the summary of significant accounting policies. The financial reporting framework that has been applied in their preparation is applicable law and the CIPFA/LASAAC Code of Practice on Local Authority Accounting in the United Kingdom 2017/18.

In our opinion the financial statements:

- give a true and fair view of the financial transactions of the Pension Fund during the year ended 31 March 2018 and the amount and disposition of the fund's assets and liabilities as at 31 March 2018 other than liabilities to pay pensions and other benefits after the end of the scheme year; and
- have been properly prepared in accordance with the CIPFA/LASAAC Code of Practice on Local Authority Accounting in the United Kingdom 2017/18.

#### Basis for opinions

We conducted our audit in accordance with International Standards on Auditing (UK) (ISAs (UK)) and applicable law. Our responsibilities under those standards are further described in the Auditor's responsibilities section of our report. We are independent of the Council in accordance with the ethical requirements that are relevant to our audit of the financial statements in the UK, including the FRC's Ethical Standard, and we have fulfilled our other ethical responsibilities in accordance with these requirements. We believe that the audit evidence we have obtained is sufficient and appropriate to provide a basis for our opinion.

#### Conclusions relating to going concern

We have nothing to report in respect of the following matters in relation to which the ISAs (UK) require us to report to you where:

- the Assistant Director, Finance and Procurement's use of the going concern basis of accounting in the preparation of the financial statements is not appropriate; or
- the Assistant Director, Finance and Procurement has not disclosed in the financial statements any identified material uncertainties that may cast significant doubt about the Council's ability to continue to adopt the going concern basis of accounting for a period of at least twelve months from the date when the financial statements are authorised for issue.

# APPENDIX B

## DRAFT AUDITOR'S REPORT (CONTINUED)

### Other information

The Assistant Director, Finance and Procurement is responsible for the other information. The other information comprises the information included in the Statement of Accounts, other than the financial statements and our auditor's report thereon. Our opinion on the financial statements does not cover the other information and, except to the extent otherwise explicitly stated in our report, we do not express any form of assurance conclusion thereon.

The Chief Financial Officer is responsible for the other information. The other information comprises the information included in the Statement of Accounts, other than the financial statements and our auditor's report thereon. Our opinion on the financial statements does not cover the other information and, except to the extent otherwise explicitly stated in our report, we do not express any form of assurance conclusion thereon.

In connection with our audit of the financial statements, our responsibility is to read the other information and, in doing so, consider whether the other information is materially inconsistent with the financial statements or our knowledge obtained in the audit or otherwise appears to be materially misstated. If we identify such material inconsistencies or apparent material misstatements, we are required to determine whether there is a material misstatement in the financial statements or a material misstatement of the other information. If, based on the work we have performed, we conclude that there is a material misstatement of this other information, we are required to report that fact.

We have nothing to report in this regard.

### Responsibilities of the Assistant Director, Finance and Procurement for the financial statements

As explained more fully in the Statement of the Assistant Director, Finance and Procurement Responsibilities, the Assistant Director, Finance and Procurement is responsible for the preparation of the Statement of Accounts, which includes the financial statements, in accordance with proper practices as set out in the CIPFA/LASAAC Code of Practice on Local Authority Accounting in the United Kingdom 2017/18, and for being satisfied that they give a true and fair view. The Assistant Director, Finance and Procurement is also responsible for such internal control as the Assistant Director, Finance and Procurement determines is necessary to enable the preparation of financial statements that are free from material misstatement, whether due to fraud or error.

The Assistant Director, Finance and Procurement is required to comply with the CIPFA/LASAAC Code of Practice on Local Authority Accounting in the United Kingdom 2017/18 and prepare the financial statements on a going concern basis, unless the Council is informed of the intention for dissolution without transfer of services or function to another entity. The Assistant Director, Finance and Procurement is responsible for assessing each year whether or not it is appropriate for the Council to prepare its accounts on the going concern basis and disclosing, as applicable, matters related to going concern.

### Auditor's responsibilities for the audit of the financial statements

Our objectives are to obtain reasonable assurance about whether the financial statements as a whole are free from material misstatement, whether due to fraud or error, and to issue an auditor's report that includes our opinion. Reasonable assurance is a high level of assurance, but is not a guarantee that an audit conducted in accordance with ISAs (UK) will always detect a material misstatement when it exists. Misstatements can arise from fraud or error and are considered material if, individually or in the aggregate, they could reasonably be expected to influence the economic decisions of users taken on the basis of these financial statements.

A further description of our responsibilities for the audit of the financial statements is located on the Financial Reporting Council's website at [www.frc.org.uk/auditorsresponsibilities](http://www.frc.org.uk/auditorsresponsibilities). This description forms part of our auditor's report.

# APPENDIX B

## DRAFT AUDITOR'S REPORT (CONTINUED)

### Conclusion on the City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council's arrangements for securing economy, efficiency and effectiveness in the use of resources

#### Conclusion

On the basis of our work, having regard to the guidance on the specified criterion issued by the Comptroller and Auditor General in November 2017, we are satisfied that, in all significant respects, the City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council has put in place proper arrangements to secure economy, efficiency and effectiveness in its use of resources for the year ended 31 March 2018.

#### Basis for conclusion

We have undertaken our review in accordance with the Code of Audit Practice issued by the Comptroller and Auditor General, having regard to the guidance on the specified criterion issued in November 2017, as to whether the Council had proper arrangements to ensure it took properly informed decisions and deployed resources to achieve planned and sustainable outcomes for taxpayers and local people. The Comptroller and Auditor General determined this criterion as that necessary for us to consider in satisfying ourselves whether the Council put in place proper arrangements for securing economy, efficiency and effectiveness in its use of resources for the year ended 31 March 2018.

We planned our work in accordance with the Code of Audit Practice. Based on our risk assessment, we undertook such work as we considered necessary to form a view on whether, in all significant respects, the Council had put in place proper arrangements to secure economy, efficiency and effectiveness in its use of resources.

#### Responsibilities of the Council

The Council is responsible for putting in place proper arrangements to secure economy, efficiency and effectiveness in its use of resources, to ensure proper stewardship and governance, and to review regularly the adequacy and effectiveness of these arrangements.

#### Auditor's responsibilities in relation to review of arrangements for securing economy, efficiency and effectiveness in the use of resources

We are required under section 20(1)(c) of the Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014 to satisfy ourselves that the Council has made proper arrangements for securing economy, efficiency and effectiveness in its use of resources. The Code of Audit Practice issued by the Comptroller and Auditor General requires us to report to you our conclusion relating to proper arrangements. We are not required to consider, nor have we considered, whether all aspects of the Council's arrangements for securing economy, efficiency and effectiveness in its use of resources are operating effectively.

#### Matters on which we are required to report by exception under the Code of Audit Practice

We are required by the Code of Audit Practice to report to you if:

- we issue a report in the public interest under section 24 of the Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014;
- we make a recommendation under section 24 of the Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014; or
- we exercise any other special powers of the auditor under sections 28, 29 or 31 of the Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014.

We have nothing to report in these respects.



# APPENDIX B

## DRAFT AUDITOR'S REPORT (CONTINUED)

### Use of the audit report

This report is made solely to the members of the City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council, as a body, in accordance with part 5 of the Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014 and as set out in paragraph 43 of the Statement of Responsibilities of Auditors and Audited Bodies published by Public Sector Audit Appointments Limited. Our audit work has been undertaken so that we might state to the members of the Council those matters we are required to state to them in an auditor's report and for no other purpose. To the fullest extent permitted by law, we do not accept or assume responsibility to anyone other than the members of the Council, as a body, for our audit work, for this report, or for the opinions we have formed.

### Certificate

We certify that we have completed the audit of the City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council in accordance with the requirements of the Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014 and the Code of Audit Practice.

Mark Kirkham  
For and on behalf of Mazars LLP

Mazars House,  
Gelderd Road  
Leeds  
LS27 7JN

30 July 2018

Executive summary

Significant findings

Internal control  
recommendations

Summary of  
misstatements

Value for Money  
conclusion

Appendices

# APPENDIX C

## DRAFT CONSISTENCY REPORT

### Independent Auditor's Statement to the Members of City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council on the Pension Fund Financial Statements included within West Yorkshire Pension Fund Annual Report

We have examined the Pension Fund financial statements for the year ended 31 March 2018 included within the West Yorkshire Pension Fund annual report, which comprise the Fund Account, the Net Assets Statement and the related notes.

#### Opinion

In our opinion, the Pension Fund financial statements are consistent with the audited financial statements of City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council for the year ended 31 March 2018 and comply with applicable law and the CIPFA/LASAAC Code of Practice on Local Authority Accounting in the United Kingdom 2017/18.

#### Respective responsibilities of the Assistant Director, Finance and Procurement and the auditor

As explained more fully in the Statement of the Assistant Director, Finance and Procurement Responsibilities, the Assistant Director, Finance and Procurement is responsible for the preparation of the Pension Fund's financial statements in accordance with applicable United Kingdom law.

Our responsibility is to report to the Members of City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council as a body, whether the Pension Fund financial statements within the Pension Fund annual report are consistent with the financial statements of City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council.

We conducted our work in accordance with Auditor Guidance Note 07 – Auditor Reporting, issued by the National Audit Office. Our report on the Pension Fund financial statements contained within the audited financial statements of City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council describes the basis of our opinions on the financial statements.

#### Use of this auditor's statement

This report is made solely to the members of City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council, as a body, in accordance with Part 5 paragraph 20(5) of the Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014 and as set out in paragraph 43 of the Statement of Responsibilities of Auditors and Audited Bodies published by Public Sector Audit Appointments Limited. Our work has been undertaken so that we might state to the members of City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council those matters we are required to state to them and for no other purpose. To the fullest extent permitted by law, we do not accept or assume responsibility to anyone other than City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council and City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council's members as a body, for our audit work, for this statement, or for the opinions we have formed.

Mark Kirkham  
For and on behalf of Mazars LLP

Mazars House,  
Gelderd Road  
Leeds  
LS27 7JN

30th July 2018

Executive summary

Significant findings

Internal control  
recommendations

Summary of misstatements

Appendices

# APPENDIX D INDEPENDENCE

As part of our ongoing risk assessment we monitor our relationships with you to identify any new actual or perceived threats to our independence within the regulatory or professional requirements governing us as your auditors.

We can confirm that no new threats to independence have been identified since issuing the Audit Strategy Memorandum and therefore we remain independent.

## CONTACT

### **Mark Kirkham**

Partner

Phone: 0113 387 8850

Mobile: 07747 764 529

Email: [mark.kirham@mazars.co.uk](mailto:mark.kirham@mazars.co.uk)

### **Sharon Liddle**

Assistant Manager

Phone: 0191 383 6311

Mobile: 07881 283 343

Email: [sharon.liddle@mazars.co.uk](mailto:sharon.liddle@mazars.co.uk)