

Addendum to the Report of the Assistant Director, Office of the Chief Executive to the meeting of the Executive to be held on 7 February 2017 (Document 'BA')

Subject:

Consultation feedback and equality assessments for the 2017-18 and 2018-19 Council budget proposals - report addendum.

1. Summary

- 1.1 The report (Document BA) of the Assistant Director, Office of the Chief Executive was published on 30 January 2017 to be presented to the Executive at the meeting to be held on 7 February 2017. The report includes information from the public engagement and consultation programme in relation to the budget proposals for the 2017-18 and 18-19 budget. The report gives details of information as follows:
- the public consultation and engagement sessions to the end of 30 January 2017.
 - the written comments both postal and via the website to the end of 30 January 2017
- 1.2 The public consultation and engagement programme continues until 12 February 2017 meaning that there is an on going requirement to provide details of further information and comments received. This addendum provides an update on feedback received through the budget consultation programme from 31 January 2017 to 2 February 2017.
- 1.3 Further updates of the public consultation and engagement programme will be published and presented to the Executive meeting scheduled for 21 February 2017.

2. Updates to the levels of feedback received through the consultation

- 2.1 As of 2 February 2017 the Council has received comments from 686 people or groups through the online questionnaire. This produced comments on 739 different budget proposals for 2017/18 and 2018/19. A total of 131 comments have also been made that are not specific to particular proposals for the next two years. The number of overall comments is similar to past consultations on the Council's budget.

In addition, a total of 129 postal questionnaires have been received and 30 representations have been made through emails or letters.

Monitoring of the corporate social media accounts and Stay Connected newsletters on the budget consultation has, to date, shown 36 opinions from residents which have been passed on to be included in the overall consultation feedback and over 1,100 click-throughs to the online consultation pages.

2.2 The proposals generating most comments are;

- Theatres and Community Halls (4E10) with most comments focusing on community halls - 239
- Parks and Bereavement (4E1) with most comments on bowling greens - 218
- Physical Activity, Food and Nutrition (4PH6) with most comments focusing on the breastfeeding programme in Keighley and some on the healthy lifestyle services run in the Windhill area - 119
- Street Cleansing and Public Conveniences (4E5) with most comments on the public conveniences - 98
- Council Tax - 34
- Adults, Overall Demand Management Strategy (4A1) - 32
- Small Grants (VCS funding) (4PH7) - 24
- Ministry of Food (4E12) - 22

Other proposals that are generating between 10 and 15 comments are Homestart/ Worksafe/ Injury Minimisation (4PH5), Libraries (4E9), a Prepared and Skilled Workforce (4C3), Remodel of Visitor Information and Frontline Service (4E7), Highways maintenance (4R6), and Substance Misuse Service (4PH2). A further 19 proposals received between one and nine comments.

2.3 The levels of attendance at Community of Interest meetings has varied according to the style of the session, from business meetings to dedicated events. Through these meetings we have engaged with 172 individual people through disability groups, older people groups, low income groups, EU migrants, Gypsies and Travellers, Adult Service User Involvement Group, Refugee and Asylum Seekers and a Consortia of Ethnic Minority Organisations (COEMO) run event for local Black Minority Ethnic groups.

2.4 The Silsden Town Hall petition has received a further 530 signatures in addition to the 1311 already presented - this now totals 1841.

3.0 Updates to the feedback received on the budget proposals

3.1 Further engagement has taken place with the business sector, including supporting Boards of Producer City. Members of the People & Innovation Board were surprised by the scale of the reductions needing to be made so recognised and appreciated the challenges that the Council was facing. Members of the Place Board were also interested in the budget proposals, with some concerned about the closure of public conveniences, but accepted

the Council's wish for them to be taken into community ownership. The Trust model was also felt to be a good option. A suggestion was also made that stickers be placed on bins to explain the costs of landfill versus the income from recycling - this might encourage more people to recycle.

3.2 Further feedback from the Voluntary and Community Sector has now been received following the engagement session with it on 18 January 2017. This additional feedback is listed below (note that this is additional to that already presented in the published budget consultation feedback report for Executive on 7 February 2017).

- Support for volunteers is vital to support preventative activities, and with continued reductions in funding many volunteers will be lost.
- There was concern over Community Asset Transfer, with the liabilities of taking on buildings and the associated maintenance issues. Volunteers will not necessarily have the specialist knowledge to effectively manage buildings the services run from them.
- It was felt that care services must be personalised to the needs of the individual. They should be given choice about what is a priority for them. The level of care from services across the district varies greatly and needs more consistency.
- It was suggested that mental health issues will increase with the current budget proposals.
- Community transport is a vital service and a big issue for the elderly and vulnerable.
- It was felt that VCS organisations had received too little notice of funding ceasing, leaving them without enough time to plan for the future.
- It was felt that obesity was still an important area to invest in as a preventive intervention.
- Reducing tier 1 prevention services will only increase the needs and consequent costs further up the system.
- The Bradford Compact needs respecting and adhering to more closely.
- It was felt that more discussions are needed between the Council and the VCS, but with tailored individual conversations.

4.0 Feedback on services not subject to consultation

Some comments in the consultation were made on Council services which are not currently identified as budget proposals and about which decisions have already been made. This included comments on the district's swimming pools (14 comments now received), changing to alternate weekly bin collections (3), and Holme View Care Home closure (1).

Appendix 1 – Consultation feedback – service and equalities

Feedback from consultation contributors by proposal or budget area – additional comments since publication of 7 February 2017 Executive report have been highlighted in **bold** below.

(Where proposals have received no comment through the consultation, these have not been included in the table below.)

Ref	Budget Proposal or budget area:	Equality Assessment	Mitigation	Feedback on service and equality impacts	Outcome
		As published in December 2016			
4PH2	Substance Misuse Service - combination of redesign, re-commissioning and ceasing recovery service, dual diagnosis service, supervised medication programme, inpatient detoxification services.	Impact assessments have identified that this range of proposals could have impacts on a wide range of service users across the range of protected characteristics.	Any new contracts will continue to have the same equality requirements of the Provider under the Equality Act 2010 as the current tender. The new service specification being commissioned requires that the service is provided through various types of provision and that the service is integrated throughout providing continuity for service users. Services will be more community based with access points in multiple sites in non-substance misuse specific services making it easier for all sections of society to access them.	It was felt that reductions in this service would have a detrimental effect on health services and affect people's lives. It was suggested further conversation with CCGs was needed. The proposals to transfer care to the already stretched services delivered by Bradford District Care FT may mean longer waits for care and treatment.	Better health, better lives
4PH3	Sexual Health - combination of redesign, review and ceasing services Health development with young people, sex and relationship education in schools, emergency hormonal contraception.	Some of the services are designed specifically for parts of the population who share a protected characteristic. Therefore services are provided disproportionately to those parts of the population and the impact will reflect this.	The SRHS that is commissioned is part of a wider Sexual Health economy with GPs providing oral contraception and STI testing which is commissioned by NHSE from GP practices as part of their core service offer. Bradford residents would still be able to access SHRS (oral contraceptives and STI screening)	These programmes help to reduce teenage pregnancy. Without this service there will be increased issues around unsafe sex, depression and issues for young mothers. It was also felt that this could lead to a rise in unplanned pregnancies and increases in sexually transmitted infection, which would	Better health, better lives

		The financial implications of this reduction in budget will be applied across the whole of the contract and therefore will impact upon all potential users of the services.	within their community through their GP practice and Long Acting Reversible Contraceptives (coils and implants) and STI testing and treatment, through the SHRS that would stay situated centrally within the city centre making it accessible to all.	have wider implications on the health of the young people and their children.	
4PH4	Public Health – Tobacco – reduction in services to reduce smoking prevalence in young people, and a stop smoking service for adults.	Equality assessment carried out indicated that this proposal is likely to have no or a low impact on everyone, and so there is no disproportionate impact on any group who share protected characteristics	n/a	It was suggested that people who continue to smoke, or take up smoking will live shorter lives and have more incidence of ill health throughout their lives, creating additional demand in primary and secondary care. There could be a detrimental effect on the health and wellbeing of women of childbearing age and therefore lead to children suffering from exposure to smoking in pregnancy. These children could have long term health and social care needs.	
4PH5	Public Health - Homestart, Worksafe, Injury Minimisation Programme - phase out of these services providing support for vulnerable parents and children age 0-5 years.	Impact assessments have identified that this range of proposals could have impacts on a wide range of service users across the range of protected characteristics particularly age, disability, race and low income families. There will be impact on key public health outcomes which are likely to widen inequalities in some of our vulnerable groups as these services are delivered across the areas that have already been	Some activities may be mainstreamed into the wider transformation plan for children and young people and families in the District going forward but there will be some that will not be mitigated against. In order to manage any negative affects we will use a phased approach so that we can identify any potential risks in the first year. Some risk may be mitigated with funding from other areas within the District through Better Start and Big lottery in Keighley so the negative consequences are not as high as would be expected if the service was	It was felt important for vulnerable children to hear safety messages from people of authority, beyond parents and teachers, which the Worksafe programme provides. It provides a valuable service to the young people of Holme Wood. The project helps children understand key safety issues around gas, electricity, fires, dogs and railway lines. It also ensures children can safely get to school independently. There was concern for the cessation of funding to Home-Start. The programme supports	Better health, better lives

		identified as a strategic priority within the District's Health Inequalities Action Plan.	completely decommissioned.	vulnerable children and adults, encourages self-care and support to access to health and wellbeing services. It trains volunteer who are then able to go on to further education, training or employment. They support families to help their children reach their full potential and promote community relations, bringing people together from different backgrounds. Support is also provided to low income families, helping people maintain their homes, access housing support and find homes that appropriately meet their needs.	
4PH6	Physical Activity, Food and Nutrition - cessation of grants to VCS organisations delivery range of activities including 'cook and eat', physical activity, food growing and breastfeeding support.	Services are currently commissioned from a variety of BME organisations and groups based in low income areas to ensure positive outcomes for all parts of the community. The race equality impact is judged to be high, because of the high BME take up of VCS services.	The Health Improvement Team will support providers/organisations and service users proactively with advice and sign-posting as opportunities are identified.	The principle concern raised is the consequent ceasing of the breast feeding service run from Keighley Healthy Living. It is a preventative service, allowing children a good start in life, through encouraging and supporting longer periods of breast feeding. It helps prevent health problems (obesity, osteoporosis, gastrointestinal, respiratory, cancers). It will lead to a loss of hospital visits support. It was felt that even if all other services were ceased from KHL, that the breastfeeding service should continue even if hosted elsewhere. It was suggested that if every woman breastfed for 4 months it would save the NHS £40m a year. There was separate concern over the loss of health support for young people through cessation/reduction	Better health, better lives

				<p>of these budgets. Commissions need to be modernised and outcomes related. As a lot of these commissions are run by the VCS, it was suggested that this brought in great value for money through their engagement of volunteers. More people take up new activities as a consequence and trust is built at a community level. There was a suggestion that reductions could be made through discussions but that the cessation of the funding would not be the answer - a streamlined service with a small number of trained peers across the district would work.</p> <p>There was concern that reductions of funding in this area would have a detrimental affect on the Roma communities. LACO as one of the few organisations working with this community would welcome a dialogue about future shared support of Roma people.</p> <p>It is felt that not enough notice has been given to commissioned organisations, who had been planning ahead, but who will now not receive funding. They bring much additional benefit to the district with volunteer time, extensive community networks and links, and millions of pounds of third party revenue. Several comments were also received in support of health services run in the Windhill area.</p> <p>It was felt that there is the potential for increased morbidity</p>	
--	--	--	--	--	--

				in these vulnerable groups.	
4PH7	Small Grants (VCS funding) - cessation of small grants delivering projects on sexual health, smoking cessation, cancer awareness, teenage pregnancy, and healthy lifestyles.	Equality assessment carried out indicated that this proposal is likely to have no or a low impact on everyone, and so there is no disproportionate impact on any group who share protected characteristics	n/a	<p>There was concern about removal of the suite of small grants to tackle obesity, heart disease and cancer in the wards where residents experience the poorest health. A reduction not a cessation to the funding was suggested, with a whole systems approach.</p> <p>There has been particular concern about the closure of the Healthy Lifestyle programme. It is a popular 'open-door' service which if lost will impact on the health of the district. It focuses on preventative work and trains numerous volunteers, helping people look after themselves and make positive health choices. This includes supporting people with mental health problems such as depression and loneliness. Support for carers is also an important aspect of their work. It was suggested that more measurable ways of evidencing progress needed to be adopted.</p>	Better health, better lives
4PH8	Public Health - Warm Homes Healthy People Programme - short-term, winter activity based programme which supports those most in need of Winter Warmth services.	Currently the proposal offers support to a range of vulnerable householders, many of whom share particular protected characteristics. Removing the programme's main funding reduces the breadth of service offered and may disadvantage some people.	The current budget includes £30,000 received from City and District's CCG's Resilience fund. This may continue to be available beyond the time when funding via Health and Wellbeing ends. Should the CCG contribution continue it would not be able to support a WHHP programme the size it is now; tighter more specific client targeting would be required. In 2016/17 support to develop a	This service keeps people from becoming dependent on statutory services so is preventative.	Better health, better lives

			<p>new approach to funding was granted to the partners, this has allowed the creation of a crowd funding website which plans to raise £25k this year. It is planned to build on this in 2017/18 with the hope that core services such as fuel poverty and food poverty work streams can be maintained. Additionally there are existing partners such as Ground Works/ Family Action and others who fund raise for services independently and join in the programme each winter. It is hoped this can be continued.</p>		
4A1	<p>Adults - Overall Demand Management Strategy - moving from a dependency model to one that promotes independence and resilience (e.g. reducing numbers coming in to care, care system culture change, speeding up integration, redesign enablement, reviewing financial needs, continued personalisation).</p>	<p>Older people and people with Mental Health & Learning Disabilities will predominantly be affected by this proposal but the focus will be on personalised services for people so the impact on protected characteristics will be mitigated at individual level. As part of the Strategy to reduce residential and nursing places it is intended that more extra care schemes are developed, which will help to improve people's lives and reduce expenditure across all groups. As the proposal is developed, the detail of impacts will be further assessed to ensure any potential implications on</p>	<p>Our approach will seek to focus on people's strengths and enabling people to manage properly understood, proportionate and positive risks in living their lives. We will undertake individual assessments and carry out extensive engagement with service users, carers and advocates to ensure seamless transitions for any service users affected. This will enable us to meet our duty under the Care Act 2014 and mitigate against any disproportionate negative impact on any person with a protective characteristic. By offering other options for people in terms of housing and care support, people will have the opportunity to access appropriate services that meet their assessed needs and be in a position to maintain their independence and to continue to have a positive</p>	<p>Concern over the future of dementia care and that the elderly needed more support. There was a suggestion that more money should be sought from the government in the same way that the North Yorkshire authority did. It was also suggested that a focus on reducing waiting times between referral and support was needed. More money going to support the increasing numbers of elderly people was felt to be important, with more help with home care.</p> <p>The suggestion of closure of any care homes causes concern, especially those supporting people with dementia.</p> <p>More dynamic and creative support is needed e.g. supporting someone to become more independent by</p>	<p>Better health, better lives</p>

		<p>protected characteristics are minimised.</p>	<p>contribution and be inclusive in their local community. This will ensure where possible people with particular characteristics are not disproportionately affected. We will further review the potential impact on protected characteristics as part of the development of the delivery programme.</p>	<p>helping them learn to cook. To begin with they will need more support but less as time goes on. People need to be in homes they can maintain themselves and have the additional support to remain independent as long as possible.</p> <p>Concern over reductions in social care will lead to more bed blockages in hospitals.</p> <p>The idea of supported living is to enable people to become more independent, but it was felt that this doesn't happen; many places just offer care and don't encourage independence. Digital solutions increase the possibilities of isolation and loneliness.</p> <p>To deliver such a scheme will require greater provision of domiciliary care - at a time when the new Living Wage is causing a number of providers to close. These closures are contributing to the delays in care packages being made available, so there is already a vicious circle of contributing factors that are likely to be exacerbated by trying to keep more people safely in their own homes. The early assessment of needs will require greater input from community health and social care staff who are already stretched.</p>	
--	--	---	---	---	--

4C5	Service Wide - Further management savings - a review is undertaken of the management structure within children's social care	n/a	n/a	Greater efficiencies should be found.	
4C6	Early Help - Management restructure - review structures in early help for children and families commissioned from VCS, youth offending team, crime prevention, family centres, families first.	This service works with a higher percentage of children and families from disadvantaged households and any reduction in service may result in a disproportionate affect on low income groups needing this support.	The review will ensure that resource is most effectively targeted at areas of need, with careful mapping of service needs and outcomes. This process will be done alongside the VCS to ensure that impact is mitigated where possible. Where possible, resources will be reduced in back office and management functions.	It was felt that investment in pre-school children was vital for the future.	Better health, better lives
4C9	Disabled Children Team - Build on the review already underway with CAMHS to ensure a service that meets the needs of children moving forward and is delivered within a reduced budget	This service works with disabled children who have are a group with a protected characteristic. Reduction in this service impacts on this specific group of young people.	A review of the CAMHS service with a financial appraisal will ensure that through achieving better value for money, direct service reductions are minimised. The review will ensure that resource is most effectively targeted at areas of need, with careful mapping of service needs and outcomes. Where possible resources will be reduced in back office and management functions. This change impacts on disabled children, but reductions are in place across the full service and have not targeted this group disproportionately.	It was felt to be really important to invest in preventative services and ones that maintain peoples mental well being. This proposal could increase the need for hospital admissions for this group.	Better health, better lives
4C13	Drugs and Alcohol Team - a review of the work of the team and all of the other services that support young people with alcohol and drug issues	n/a	n/a	Will potentially have a detrimental effect on the health and wellbeing of women of childbearing age and therefore lead to children who are suffering the sequelae of exposure to drugs and alcohol in pregnancy. These children will have long term	Better health, better lives

				health and social care needs	
4C12	Early Years school - removal of transitional funding readiness - reduction in grants to small providers undertaking community based activity to help prepare children for school.	Equality assessment carried out indicates that this proposal is unlikely to have any detrimental impact and so there is no disproportionate impact on any group that shared protected characteristics.	n/a	Focus should be on supporting children not administration costs.	Great start, good schools
4PH1	Public Health Services for Children 0-19 - reduce the overall Public Health budget for 0-19 years, covering Health Visiting, Family Nurse Partnership, School Nursing and Oral Health.	Any reduction in Public Health investment carries with it a risk that the children and young people will experience deterioration in health and wellbeing within the district. The reduction in service will impact on quality and access as all training and resources will be withdrawn and providers will not access up to date training which could impact on partnership working both externally and internally, which in return will result in lack of awareness amongst their clients groups which are mainly the protected groups such as mothers/parents, babies and early year's children services.	Using a phased approach will help to plan and prepare any risks which can then be managed through the transformation process for a more integrated model for children and young people and the service will continue to provide statutory services.	It was felt that funding reductions could lead to late detection of issues which could lead to long term health conditions which would require primary and / or secondary health care intervention throughout an individual's lifetime.	Great start, good schools
4E7.	Remodel of Visitor Information & frontline service - reduce the number and/or size of	The potential closure of VICs could have a disproportionate impact on older customers unable to	Alternative options are being explored including seasonal visitor information centres in destinations such as Saltaire, Haworth and Ilkley	It was felt that visitor information centres work well due to their personalised approach to the service. Resources including VICs should	Better skills, more good jobs and a growing

	Visitor Information Centres (VICs), moving to a more digital basis promoting the district to target audiences, with the potential for VIC information points as co-located provision.	access information electronically.	with support from local groups.	also not just be focused on Bradford city centre, but support given to outlying areas too. There was also concern over the impact on tourism and consequent economic benefits from any loss of VICs.	economy
4E8.	Events and Festivals - review to develop a more sustainable and balanced events programme. Direct funding to	Equality assessment carried out indicated that this proposal is likely to have no or a low impact on everyone, and so there is no disproportionate impact on any group who share protected characteristics	n/a	Some feel that greater cuts should be implemented, others feel more support should remain with arts programmes. Support for continued funding to arts project was also received, with the view that they contribute economically and culturally to communities. It promotes tourism and attracts new businesses and provides employment opportunities. Some felt that private enterprises should be responsible for events.	Better skills, more good jobs and a growing economy
4E9.	Libraries - reduction in the number of libraries directly provided. Investigate potential for alternative delivery models.	Equality assessment carried out indicated that this proposal is likely to have no or a low impact on everyone, and so there is no disproportionate impact on any group who share protected characteristics	n/a	It was felt that volunteers would need an intensive training programme should libraries move into community ownership. There was also support for libraries being part of community hubs to focus community resources to a single location. There was concern that areas of deprivation would not have the community capacity to run a local library. The libraries facilities, such as computers and photocopiers as well as books, are a vital resource. Where libraries already reside in community halls there is further concern as the Community Halls are under review as well.	Better skills, more good jobs and a growing economy

				It was felt that stopping funding for libraries, would have negative affect when added to the financial pressures schools face, and the finances of individuals who are affected by Universal Credit.	
4E10.	Theatres and Community Halls - Trust type models being investigated. Community halls to be transferred through Community Asset Transfer where possible.	Equality assessment carried out indicated that this proposal is likely to have no or a low impact on everyone, and so there is no disproportionate impact on any group who share protected characteristics	n/a	<p>Closure of the community halls would not just take away a facility but also stop all the activities that take place in them from happening. The halls are used by a very diverse range groups which are fundamental to local communities. Local charities are also supported through fundraising activities that take place in these halls.</p> <p>There was concern that recent investment to halls would prove a waste of money, as would volunteer time in raising some of the funds. It is felt that community halls can be the only secular community meeting point. Not all areas have enough volunteers or expertise to take on the running of halls. With expanding populations, more community facilities are needed not less.</p> <p>There were also suggestions of ensuring there was one community supported building/hub in each area that housed all essential services. To make them profitable, space for businesses and residential dwellings could be included. They need to be run in a more commercial way.</p> <p>It was suggested that professional support with fund raising from the</p>	Better skills, more good jobs and a growing economy

				Council would help communities maximise the use of the halls.	
4E12.	Ministry of Food - possible cessation of the service teaching people how to cook, eat and improve their long term health.	Whilst the Ministry of Food is a discretionary service provided by the Council, its closure will by definition have a disproportionate effect upon those people who share a protected characteristic. Those attracted to the services provided by the Ministry of Food tend to be those from disadvantaged communities where behaviour change is required to reduce obesity through education and teaching cooking skills.	The Health Improvement Team will support providers/organisations proactively with advice and sign-posting as opportunities are identified.	The Ministry of Food does more than just provide food and nutrition advice. It is a service in itself that provides necessary skills to people saving them from accessing health services in the future. The centre is used to support vulnerable people, tailored to their individual needs and getting them involved in community life e.g. people with Asperger syndrome, disadvantaged people. There was a suggestion that this service wasn't being used to its full potential and could be paid for by schools. Concern about the cumulative effect with the Public Health cuts when obesity is big problem.	Better skills, more good jobs and a growing economy
4C3	Children's Services - a prepared and Skilled Workforce - staffing, restructure, reduction in the Connexions contract with longer term service brought back in to Council, investigate regional data centre, cessation of Employment Opportunities Fund (EOF).	This proposal in regard to the Connexions Service contract will have a negative impact on people who share a protected characteristic. This service directly supports young people who are NEET, the cohort being comprised of young people with complex and multiple needs related to the protected characteristics and long-term low-income unemployed adults.	To mitigate the potential disproportionate impact of the Connexions Service proposal, there will be a re-design of the Connexions type activity to provide a minimum statutory service with a greater reliance on the Bradford Pathways approach that will be underpinned with more effective information, advice and guidance framework. Greater linkages and working Page 52 with other front line staff working with young people will also be explored. It is not feasible to fully mitigate the impact of the proposals given proposed funding levels.	There are many concerns over the loss of work provided by the Connexions service. Face to face support is vital. It provides advice and support on careers, training, housing, drugs, alcohol, domestic violence, social care referrals. The help is received by people with a range of issues including mental health, behaviour, attendance, families. It was suggested that funding for young people could be centralised through Connexions, picking up services provided through housing support and families first. There is a lack of support for both	Better skills, more good jobs and a growing economy

				<p>prevention and resolution of young people's problems.</p> <p>Concern over loss of funding for the EOF and the likely impact on increased young people not in employment or training.</p> <p>It was felt that this is a big area that affects disabled people who benefit from these programmes. Disabled people are much more likely to be out of work and need support to break down barriers to having fulfilling lives (whether in paid employment or as volunteers).</p> <p>The apprenticeship levy precludes many disabled people from accessing it (entry level is a level 2 qualification). Opportunities for internships would be welcome as an alternative.</p> <p>A request was made that they would like a commitment from the Council to work with engagement partnerships on any replacement services being designed. This would ensure they are fit for purpose and are inclusive for as many disabled people as possible. This should include people with learning disabilities and people with autistic spectrum conditions.</p>	
4R1	Regeneration Services - Industrial Services Group Operational Savings - Industrial Services Group (ISG) is a trading service	n/a	n/a	Disabled People in Bradford value the Industrial Services Group.	Better skills, more good jobs and a growing economy

	currently running at a cost to the Council. The proposal is to reduce the staffing structure to suit the present workloads starting with bringing the service back into line with the base budget.				
4R4	Regeneration Services - Centralisation of Urban Traffic Control including reduced maintenance of street lighting asset	n/a	n/a	There are already too many street lights not working, it was suggested this would get worse with further funding cuts. It was suggested a PFI agreement (as happens in Leeds) could reduce costs.	Better skills, more good jobs and a growing economy
4R5	Regeneration Services - Increase charges within Planning, Transportation and Highways Services – to include charge for café licences, minimum charge for events on the highway, pre-application planning advice, charge for dealing with high hedge complaints, charge for the street naming and numbering services	The introduction of fees and charges in relation to dealing with high hedge complaints may lead to disproportionate impacts on the low paid sectors of the community and senior citizens. Currently, receipt and investigation of complaints in relation to high hedges are processed by the Council on a free of charge basis. Introduction of a minimum charge for co-ordination and marshalling of events on the highway could adversely affect those community interest groups/areas of protected characteristics who wish to arrange an event on the highway. The impact of this proposal may lead to a number of events no	Discounts for various types of organisations in relation to charges for events on the highway could be introduced to help minimise the impact of this aspect of the proposal. It should be noted that this proposal will not affect the holding of a street party which will remain free of charge as per national guidance. The mechanism for charging for dealing with high hedge complaints may similarly introduce a discount for members of the community over a certain age making a complaint.	There was the suggestion that charges for high hedge complaints should come with a concession for those on low incomes, not a concession for older people. The example was given that a younger disabled person may be living on benefits and hardly ever leave their home – their next door neighbour’s hedge may block their view of the outside world – but they have to pay whilst the person over 70 with a private retirement pension and large savings up the street gets it for free. This wasn’t felt to be fair or equitable.	Better skills, more good jobs and a growing economy

		longer taking place along traditional routes given the costs associated with the administration and approval of traffic management.			
4R6	Options related to discretionary budgets for highway maintenance works including minor drainage improvements, pavement repairs and footpath and snicket maintenance	Whilst the cost of the works delivered through the local area maintenance budgets may be relatively small, the impact of non-action could have a disproportionate impact on the lives of the districts citizens. Some footpaths and snickets are currently impassable due to lack of maintenance which is a consequence of the current reduced budget allocation.	As the scope of the impact arising from this proposal could be wide ranging and dependent upon the nature of any specific maintenance requirements, it is not possible to propose measures to fully mitigate or eliminate the disproportionate impacts. However, the nature of the prioritisation framework (which is still to be developed), which would be used to assess the priority for action of any requests, could incorporate appropriate consideration of the characteristic of the person needing action (e.g. include age and/or disability criteria).	Concern that reduced maintenance would lead to reduced footfall in city and town centres which would have a knock on to businesses being successful (and therefore business rates paid). There was a suggestion that highways maintenance would cause issues and be at odds with the active travel programmes. Poorer access will also have a detrimental impact on people with disabilities and older people. It was felt that this needs to be thought of in a wider sense – poor pavements and snickets reduce people’s ability to get out and about safely and their independence means greater reliance on services both from a dependence point of view but also regarding falls and cost to the Health and Social Care services.	Better skills, more good jobs and a growing economy
4R7	Reduction in Highways Services operational budgets associated with operational accommodation, transport gateway and subway maintenance.	Failure to undertake any maintenance of gateways and subways will very rapidly lead to these assets deteriorating and potentially becoming impassable. Winter maintenance operations would be significantly impacted by the reduction in DLO operational bases meaning longer times	Any loss of a subway/underpass facility could be offset through the introduction of a crossing. Research has shown that these types of crossing are more attractive to pedestrian users than subways as they are generally perceived as reducing the fear of attack/crime for pedestrian users. However, such facilities on major corridors are problematic as they need to cross six	The existing and proposed reductions in gritting is causing problems especially in the Keighley area. It was felt that prioritising the maintenance of one area over another seemed inequitable – reduced gritting will prevent support staff / home care/ district nurses/ GPs etc from safely getting to their clients.	Better skills, more good jobs and a growing economy

		<p>being necessary to grit the routes in the district, Page 57 potentially meaning that areas in the north of the district may be untreated in periods of inclement weather. This could therefore impact on some of the protected characteristics</p>	<p>lanes of traffic and therefore their design can lead to increased delays for general traffic and increased frustration for drivers. The impact of the closure of the depot at Stocksbridge and the consequent impact on winter maintenance operations will need to be carefully considered within the context of winter gritting routes and treatment programmes. Consideration of more pro-active treatment regimes for areas in the north of the district will need to be developed in order to ensure that problems associated with reactive maintenance are mitigated.</p>		
<p>4R11</p>	<p>Introduction of limited lighting hours / switch off of street lighting on non-principal road network</p>	<p>Introduction of this proposal in additional areas of the district will have a disproportionately negative impact on some protected characteristics. Fear of crime amongst the elderly will increase where back streets and residential roads are unlit during the early hours of the morning and it is from this characteristic group that the greatest impact is anticipated. Similarly fear of crime on unlit streets could adversely impact the protected characteristic groups of disability, race, religion/belief and sex who may all experience increased levels of concern about the proposal.</p>	<p>The Council has developed a set of criteria which are used to select streets where limited lighting hours are introduced. These criteria assess road safety statistics, criminal activity records, infrastructure condition and involve consultation with the local community on any proposals being prepared. Any streets which are considered appropriate to be included in the programme of limited lighting operation will be fully appraised using this model before a decision is taken on whether or not to implement the limited lighting hours infrastructure is taken. Those streets with high criminal activity and/or poor road safety records will not be included in the project beyond their initial assessment. To avoid any undue distress to local residents only those streets which “pass” the desktop assessment will be</p>	<p>Reduction in street lighting could encourage anti social behaviour and crime.</p>	<p>Better skills, more good jobs and a growing economy</p>

			consulted upon with the local community.		
4R13	Businesses starting-up, growing and investing - Economic Development Service – reduce city park maintenance fund, reduce European Strategic Investment Fund match funding and remove support for the Bfunded web site.	Equality assessment carried out indicated that this proposal is likely to have no or a low impact on everyone, and so there is no disproportionate impact on any group who share protected characteristics	n/a	It was suggested that in the long term transferring Bfunded would have an impact on low income groups – this is due to them being supported by activities run by the VCS who use Bfunded to bring in funding to the district.	Better skills, more good jobs and a growing economy
4R20	Sustrans promotes young people travelling to school actively and/or sustainably - initially to no longer accept new schools onto the programme with existing schools provision being phased out over the following years of this budget proposal.	The nature of the Active School Travel programme is such that its cessation would effectively adversely affect the young children and adolescents which the programme targets through removal of the opportunities afforded under the programme to embed health lifestyle choices. Similarly, as children with a sedentary lifestyle are predominantly found in areas of deprivation and low incomes, the cessation of this programme would likewise have an impact on this protected characteristic.	Working with schools it may be possible to introduce aspects of the programme into the school curriculum, however given the demands on pupil contact time created by the national curriculum this may not be a significant mitigation proposition.	There will be a cumulative impact on young people from this proposal and the proposals to reduce road safety training (4R21), and Homestart/injury minimisation programme/work safe (4PH5).	Better skills, more good jobs and a growing economy
4R18	Housing - Homelessness Private Rented Housing Development Officer - Delete the vacant post of private rented housing	n/a	n/a	There was an understanding that this has been replaced by 4 new posts to develop and improve the private rented offer. However there were still concerns that they are	Decent homes, that people can afford to live in

	development officer			generic type posts and the emphasis on the homeless will be lost. Concern was also expressed that rents for properties on the privately rented list are too expensive - hence people live in properties not on the list that are in poor condition affecting their health and well being	
4E1	Parks and Bereavement – parks, recreation grounds and woodlands offered as community asset transfer; management rationalisation; withdrawal from direct management of sport pitches and bowling greens; raise prices of bereavement services.	With regard to bereavement service proposals, any increase in charges, particularly at a rate above inflation, will by definition have a disproportionate effect upon those on low incomes for a service that cannot be viewed as discretionary. Given that cremation charges are currently lower than burial charges, particularly should a new grave be required, any percentage price rise will generate a higher cash increase in the cost of burials than that of cremations. This could represent a disproportionate effect for those religious and faith communities that favour burial. The implementation of a flat rate cash increase to both cremations and burials would however have increased the cremation charge to a level disproportionate to that of	The most deprived/low income communities receive support for the cost of funerals from the Council through Adult Services. The proposed above inflation increase in charges for funerals will result in local service users continuing to pay less than the average within West Yorkshire for all services. Page 66 It is intended to introduce a reduced rate for the walling of graves to coffin height which will mitigate the effect of the increases for those faith groups that adopt such a requirement.	There was concern that reduced funding for parks would not support people with and likely to have mental health issues. Most comments reflected on how effective bowling clubs, and the greens, were at providing exercise and reduction in isolation for older people - though they are used by people of all ages. It was felt that each club managing its own maintenance would not be a wise use of money, as all would need their equipment. Some were happy to have charges increased to ensure the maintenance remained with the Council. Other comments suggested that greens could be reduced to one per park, and others suggested that only the most popular greens be kept. Further suggestions were that fees and costs should be increased on other services to allow some bowling greens to maintain support e.g. library charges, no free buses, higher	Safe clean and active communities

		the burial charge in terms of comparator values of neighbouring Councils.		leisure centre charges. More discussions with representatives of the greens was encouraged to help reach a mutually agreeable solution.	
4E2	Waste Collection and Disposal Services - introduction of co-mingled recycling enabling more plastic recycling.	The proposal is likely to have no or a low impact on everyone so it is considered that there is no disproportionate impact on any group who share protected characteristics. It is however recognised that a move to alternate weekly collection could result in the residual waste bin being heavier to move around.	It is recognised that the elderly and disabled could be impacted upon by a heavier bin where there are mobility or accessibility issues. The Council already provides assisted bin lifts for residents in such circumstances. If this service is required, residents can call the Council Contact Centre and a home visit will be arranged to see how the Council can help.	It was felt more investment was needed in tackling fly tipping. More fines are needed to help the enforcement of people dropping litter and fly tipping. Assisted bin collections tend to vary around the district. Some people are given black bin bags which cannot be put out due to vermin, and have to kept inside houses. It was felt that more information needs to be shared about income created through recycling and how it is spent.	Safe clean and active communities
4E4	Environment and Sport - Customer Services - redirect face to face contact towards self service and telephone services will see a continuing decline in contact resulting in staffing efficiencies. Automated services will increase with fewer options for people to speak to a customer services advisor. More people will be expected to 'self serve' using on line services.	The Council recognises that any move toward increasing dependency on digital/online access to Services or information may potentially have a detrimental impact on residents who do not have English as a first language or who don't/can't access IT. Making services available electronically could impact on those unable to access due to ability or lack of available technology. Those with a preference or requirement to deal with a person may feel anxious and	To mitigate the potentially disproportionate impact the Council remains committed to the Five Principles of Producing Better Information for Disabled People, and will also continue to make sure the Council website is accessible. Greater self service access will provide the majority of citizens with a more efficient service; thereby freeing up the limited resources to focus on those who need the additional support. By minimising avoidable face-to-face and telephone contact with the council, officer time can be better directed to those customers who require it.	It was felt that digital access is not suitable for many gypsy and travellers, and those needing translating services also find digital access a barrier. It is difficult for many disabled people, older people and those on low incomes to travel because of mobility or cost, so it was suggested that more contact points are needed, not just in city centres. Other community hubs such as libraries should be used.	

		<p>vulnerable.</p> <p>The majority of current face-to-face customer service and an increasing proportion of telephony work is with low wage/low income groups, including people with disabilities, and older people although there has been a significant increase in enquiries from customers from Eastern Europe who have language barriers. Customer service teams carry out some home visits to customers who are unable to access Council services in other ways. However, in the context of the number of enquiries handled by the Council each year, the relative numbers of people adversely impacted by the proposed change is small.</p>			
4E5	<p>Street Cleansing and Public Conveniences - reduction in number of ward based clean teams and mechanical sweepers; removal of funding for public conveniences.</p>	<p>The proposal has the potential to have a low impact on predominantly inner city highly densely populated areas. The people who live in these areas are in the main white people on low incomes and communities from BME backgrounds. In terms of closure of the toilets there is likely to be a disproportionate impact on older people, pregnant women, parents requiring</p>	<p>Increased waste awareness and anti litter/education campaigns in affected areas and the new robust enforcement model for targeting those people that drop litter, will mitigate the impact the street cleansing proposals. In the case of public toilets work will take place to ascertain whether Parish/Town Councils, community or other voluntary groups could take over the running of those blocks proposed for closure. Consideration will also be given to whether local businesses, cafes, restaurants etc. would allow</p>	<p>The focus has been on public conveniences (PC's), with only a few comments on actual street cleansing. In all cases it is felt that PC's should not be closed as they provide a valuable facility for local people and encourage tourism. There is concern that closure will lead to people being isolated in their own homes, and knock on environmental concerns.</p> <p>There was a suggestion that more PC's could ask for donations. Pubs and cafes could also provide clear signage welcoming people to use</p>	<p>Safe clean and active communities</p>

		access to baby changing facilities, young Page 69 children, transgender community, disabled people, particularly those with complex needs, and people who, because of their physical condition, may need to visit the toilet more regularly.	people to use their facilities.	their facilities. An alternative was to put in place a bylaw requiring that all shops and cafes allow the public to use their facilities - this apparently happens in Florence, Italy. Closure would affect a lot of people including older people, disabled people and children. There was also concern about cleansing (alongside kerb side collections including recycling), and that a universal service is not appropriate as needs vary greatly across the district. Others were concerned about future driving conditions if the environment was affected. It was suggested that more community work was needed to raise awareness of littering and fly tipping.	
4E6	Cessation of the Pest Control Service - cease providing the 'paid for' service.	This proposal could have an adverse impact on people on low incomes as it removes the facility to pay for treatments in instalments although the equality assessment carried out indicated that this proposal is likely to have no or a low impact on everyone, and so there is no disproportionate impact on any group who share protected characteristics	The most common request for treatment is to deal with rats and mice and there is at least one company in Bradford which is able to provide the service cheaper than the Council.	Concern that this wouldn't be appropriate.	Safe clean and active communities
4F3	Revenues and Benefits - Rationalisation of the cash management function - Reduce the amount of cash used by and within the	n/a	n/a	Concern that access to petty cash to pay expenses etc will become a thing of the past with expenses being paid through BACS. This will result in some people not being able to take part and will	A well run council

	organisation and reduce the cost of cash management functions through the increased digitalisation of customer payment options.			mean only wealthy people can have a say.	
4H2	Human Resources - Terms & Conditions - Removal of non contractual overtime payments and removal of essential car allowance lump sum payments.	n/a	n/a	Concern that staff will have to use their own cars instead of pool cars/public transport.	A well run council
4X1	Office of the Chief Executive Restructure - service influences, negotiates, communicates and collaborates with communities and partners to deliver the district's priorities.	Until the detailed restructure proposals are drafted it's not possible to be specific about impacts on equalities characteristics within our communities. However it is expected that would be some low level impacts across a number of groups.	<p>Communication and collaboration with voluntary, public and private sector partners at local and regional level will need to increase and less formal, more responsive and dynamic partnership structures / reporting will need to be developed.</p> <p>Clear prioritisation, and the concept of the Council being the lead facilitator and negotiator rather than the lead provider of resources, will be necessary in developing the capacity to capitalise on a considerable partnership asset base for the benefit of Bradford District.</p> <p>The absolute necessity to develop the Council's partners' and communities' skills and confidence in being fully part of Team Bradford, finding innovative approaches to service provision together, would have to be the overarching priority for the new, integrated corporate function.</p>	<p>Concern over unnecessary expense in this area following major cuts already made.</p> <p>There was concern that this may reduce or stop partnership support. The support must not be diluted and the re-structure should recognise the risk of the skills gap that any reduction to partnership working would create.</p> <p>It was felt that partnership and communities of interest work is vital in scrutinising, acting in a critical friend role, consultation, engagement, co-production, integrated working as well as getting information.</p>	A well run council

			To operate effectively within the context of rapidly diminishing resources for the 'local state' only focused, high priority work would be undertaken, working closely with Members, officers, partners and communities.		
<i>Not proposal specific</i>	Raise in Council Tax	n/a	n/a	Most comments reflect that people don't want an increase in council tax. People felt they cannot afford increases in council tax, especially as wages/incomes are not increasing as well. It is felt that the social care 'levy' be spent on social care, but that this is unlikely to be a long term solution. Other comments suggested that more should be done to collect unpaid council tax.	A well run council