

MINUTES OF A MEETING OF THE COUNCIL HELD IN COUNCIL CHAMBER, CITY HALL, BRADFORD ON TUESDAY, 14 JANUARY 2020

Commenced 4.00 pm
Concluded 7.25 pm

PRESENT

The Lord Mayor (Councillor Lee) and Councillors:

LABOUR

A Ahmed	Akhtar	Amran	Azam
Berry	Choudhry	Dodds	Duffy
Dunbar	Engel	Farley	Ferriby
Firth	Godwin	D Green	Greenwood
Hinchcliffe	Abid Hussain	Arshad Hussain	Kamran Hussain
S Hussain	T Hussain	Iqbal	Jabar
Jamil	Jenkins	Johnson	I Khan
S Khan	Lal	Lee	Lintern
Mir	Mohammed	Mukhtar	Mullaney
Nazir	Ross-Shaw	Salam	Shabbir
Shafiq	Shaheen	M Slater	Tait
Thirkill	Thornton	Wainwright	Warburton
Watson	Wood		

CONSERVATIVE

Ali	Barker	Bibby	Brown
Davies	Ellis	Gibbons	Goodall
K Green	Hargreaves	Herd	Heseltine
Pennington	Pollard	Poulsen	Riaz
Smith	Sullivan	Townend	Whitaker
Winnard			

LIBERAL DEMOCRAT

Griffiths	Humphreys	Knox	Reid
Stubbs	J Sunderland	R Sunderland	Ward

BRADFORD INDEPENDENTS

Khadim Hussain
Sajawal

GREEN

Love
Warnes

INDEPENDENTS

Hawkesworth

QUEENSBURY INDEPENDENT

L Cromie

The Lord Mayor in the Chair

73. DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST

The following disclosures on matters under consideration were made:

Recommendation from the Executive – ‘A Place to Call Home, A Place to thrive’, Housing Strategy for the Bradford District 2020-2030 (Minute 83)

Councillor Hinchcliffe declared an interest as the owner of an unoccupied property and Councillors Cromie and Griffiths as private landlords.

Recommendation from the Governance and Audit Committee – Community Governance Review for a New Local Council in the Shipley Area (Minute 84)

The following declared an interest as Shipley residents: Councillors Berry, Dunbar, Firth, Jenkins, Love, Shabbir and Warnes.

Motion – Supporting Rough Sleepers in Bradford (Minute 89)

Councillor Berry declared an interest as he was a Trustee of the Bridge project.

Update on the Council’s Pay Policy Statement (Minute 91)

Councillors Griffiths and Jeanette Sunderland declared an interest as beneficiaries of the West Yorkshire Pension Fund.

The disclosures were made on the basis of transparency and those Members participated in the meeting during consideration and voting on the items.

ACTION: City Solicitor

74. MINUTES

Resolved –

That the minutes of the meeting held on 15 October 2019 be signed as a correct record.

75. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors R Ahmed, H Khan, Naylor, Swallow and Whiteley.

76. WRITTEN ANNOUNCEMENTS FROM THE LORD MAYOR

DEATH OF FORMER LORD MAYOR, BARRY THORNE

With great sadness the Lord Mayor reported to Council the death of former Lord Mayor and long-serving Councillor, Barry Thorne who had passed away on Christmas Eve. Barry represented the Keighley West ward between 1973 and 1976 and again from 1978 until 2004. He was subsequently a member of Haworth, Cross Roads and Stanbury Parish Council for eight years, before later serving as a Keighley Town Councillor for the Bracken Bank and Ingrow ward. For many years Barry had campaigned for the rights of people with learning disabilities and was heavily involved as a fundraiser for the charity Bradford Disability Sport & Leisure.

Gratitude was placed on record for Barry's many years of service. The Deputy Lord Mayor would be attending Barry's funeral service and the Lord Mayor had written, on behalf of the district, to Barry's widow and family to express sympathy.

DEATH OF FORMER COUNCILLOR RONALD KITSON

The Lord Mayor also reported the death of former Councillor Ronald Kitson, who died on 9 December 2019 at the age of 79. Ronald served as a Councillor for the Undercliffe Ward from 1972 to 1973 and served this Authority as a councillor for the Bowling ward from 1976 until 1980 and Bolton ward from 1995 until 1999.

Gratitude was placed on record for his service and condolences extended to Ronald's family on his passing.

Members paid tribute to both former councillors Barry Thorne and Ronald Kitson.

DEATH OF MRS KARTARI CHAND

The death of Mrs Kartari Chand at the age of 107, who was possibly the oldest person in the District has been reported. Sympathies were conveyed to Mrs Chand's family in their time of loss

Members and Officers stood for a minute's silence in memory of those who had died.

HER MAJESTY THE QUEEN'S NEW YEAR'S HONOURS LIST

In Her Majesty The Queen's New Year's Honours list, the work and service of a number of local people had been recognised. The Leader of the Council and the Lord Mayor had written to give their congratulations to the following: Kersten England, CBE; Owen Almondo Williams, OBE; Julie Jarvis, OBE; Margaret Timmins, MBE; Patricia Wilkinson, MBE and Ruth Terry, MBE.

APPOINTMENT OF DEPUTY LIEUTENANTS

Congratulations were also offered to the following people who had recently been appointed by Her Majesty's Lord-Lieutenant of West Yorkshire as Deputy Lieutenants: Gill Arnold, JP, DL; Nicola Chance-Thompson, DL; Manoj Joshi, DL; Roger Marsh, DL; Sandy Needham, DL; Dr Nima Poovaya-Smith, OBE, DL.

VISIT OF THEIR ROYAL HIGHNESSES THE DUKE AND DUCHESS OF CAMBRIDGE

The Lord Mayor announced that the District was to receive a visit from Their Royal Highnesses The Duke and Duchess of Cambridge on Wednesday 15 January 2020. A number of projects would be visited which support the community and promote cohesion and the visit would recognise Bradford's place as one of the most diverse cities in the country.

BRADFORD NAMED AS THE UK'S "MOST IMPROVED" CITY 2019

The District had been designated as 2019's top improver among UK cities in the

Good Growth for Cities 2019 Index, published by professional services company PwC and Demos, Britain's leading cross party Think-Tank. Bradford was named as the most improved city in the UK for jobs, growth, skills levels and quality of life, with mention being made of the large reduction in the rate of unemployment. The Guardian also subsequently produced a guide to the best 15 places to visit in 'Beautiful Bradford'.

Thanks were given to all those whose hard work and determination had helped to bring about this boost to this city's national standing.

77. INSPECTION OF REPORTS AND BACKGROUND PAPERS

There were no restricted documents.

78. PETITIONS

No petitions were received.

79. PUBLIC QUESTION TIME

No public questions were received.

80. MEMBERSHIP OF COMMITTEES AND JOINT COMMITTEES

Resolved –

- (1) That Councillor Stubbs replace Councillor Reid on the Governance and Audit Committee and Councillor Reid be the alternate.**
- (2) That Councillor Sajawal be appointed to the Bradford East Area Committee in place of Councillor Humphries and Councillor Humphries be an alternate.**
- (3) That Councillor Cromie be appointed to the Bradford South Area Committee in place of Councillor Tait and Councillor Tait be an alternate.**
- (4) That Councillor Khadim Hussain be appointed to the Keighley Area Committee in place Councillor Godwin and Councillor Godwin be an alternate.**

ACTION: City Solicitor

81. REPORT BY THE LEADER OF COUNCIL

Council Document "M" details the verbal questions from Members to the Leader of Council and the answers given on the matters contained in the Leader of Council's written report.

82. MEMBER QUESTION TIME

Council Document "N" details the questions from Members to the Leader of

Council and Portfolio Holders and the answers given.

83. RECOMMENDATION FROM THE EXECUTIVE - 'A PLACE TO CALL HOME, A PLACE TO THRIVE', HOUSING STRATEGY FOR THE BRADFORD DISTRICT 2020-2030

At the meeting of the Executive held on 2 January 2020 consideration was given to the report of the Strategic Director, Place (**Executive Document "AE"**) presenting the revised housing strategy, 'A Place to Call Home, A Place to Thrive, Housing Strategy for Bradford District, 2020-2030' to be referred to Council for approval. The strategy set out the vision, priorities, challenges and approach for meeting the housing needs of the residents of the district. The strategy is a high-level strategic document for the Council and its partners to follow when developing and delivering housing policies, plans, and delivery programmes.

Resolved –

That the housing strategy, "A Place to Call Home, A Place to Thrive, Housing Strategy for the District, 2020-2030' be approved.

ACTION: Strategic Director Place

84. RECOMMENDATION FROM THE GOVERNANCE AND AUDIT COMMITTEE - COMMUNITY GOVERNANCE REVIEW FOR A NEW LOCAL COUNCIL IN THE SHIPLEY AREA

At the meeting of the Governance and Audit Committee held on 28 November 2019 the City Solicitor submitted a report (Governance and Audit Committee Document "V") providing feedback from the Community Governance Review for a proposed new Local Council in the Shipley area which was triggered by receipt of a petition to the Council from local residents. The Committee recommended that Council approve the Reorganisation Order which was attached to **Document "O"**.

An amendment moved by Councillor Ellis was defeated. It was then,

Resolved –

That the Reorganisation Order attached as Appendix 3 to Document "O" be approved and that the City Solicitor be authorised to affix the Council's seal to the Order to bring it into effect.

ACTION: Strategic Director Place/City Solicitor

85. TRANSPARENCY AND COMPETENCE

A motion was moved by Councillor Davies.

An amendment moved by Councillor Ross-Shaw, as set out in the resolution below, was carried.

Resolved –

Council notes that:

- **The former Ferniehurst School site in Baildon was developed as part of Bradford Council's Affordable Housing programme.**
- **The Affordable Housing programme has delivered more affordable housing for the people of this district than would have been the case if the Council had handed it over to a private developer for delivery.**
- **Bradford Council choosing to develop its own land for housing on the former Ferniehurst School site in Baildon, rather than selling it to a private developer, meant that the Council was able to help unlock overall funding of £1,929,000 from Homes England to help deliver affordable housing.**
- **The Ferniehurst School site proposals put to the public and the Regulatory and Appeals Committee were for "mixed tenure" - 72 houses. Of these 20 were to be for social housing with day to day management delegated to a social housing provider (planning application 15/01549/MAF).**
- **An experienced private sector housing estate agent was engaged to value and market the properties but despite initial interest insufficient numbers were sold, in part due to a general slowdown in the housing market.**
- **Therefore additional funding was secured from Homes England to convert some of the properties to rental, all of which are now occupied. This funding provided greater certainty to the scheme and secured a higher grant rate, and delivered immediate rental income.**
- **The Council has an agreed Allocations Policy which is administered by the housing management agent (currently Incommunities) in consultation with Housing Options and based on housing need. Working with Incommunities the properties in Baildon were let in accordance with the Council's allocations policy and those with highest housing need were allocated the properties. The allocations system takes into account the applicant's preferences and it is likely that many of the tenants will have had a prior connection to the Baildon area.**
- **The Council arranged regular security patrols to minimise the impact of vandalism on vacant units while they were being switched to affordable rent.**
- **A lessons learned exercise on the Affordable Housing programme, which includes this site, was conducted in 2018 with input and advice from Local Partnerships, a joint venture owned by HM Treasury and the Local Government Association to help share best practice between all levels of government. This has been referenced in Scrutiny reports.**

Council resolves to:

- **Ensure local councillors are kept up to date on the progress of housing schemes with Council involvement being delivered in their wards.**

- **Continue with our ambition to deliver affordable housing on brownfield sites in line with our recently adopted Housing Strategy, ‘A Place to Call Home, A Place to Thrive’.**

ACTION: Strategic Director Place

86. THE PROVISION OF PHYSICAL PARKING PERMITS

A motion was moved by Councillor Kyle Green.

An amendment moved by Councillor Ross-Shaw, as set out in the resolution below, was carried.

Resolved –

Council notes that:

- **Applications for residential parking permits have been online for a number of years without issue, similar to the government’s provision of vehicle tax.**
- **More and more local authorities have moved to or are moving to virtual permits.**
- **Virtual permits provide a number of benefits over traditional paper permits:**
 - **Reduced penalty charge notices issued for failure to display permit, as residents no longer have to remember to display their permit**
 - **No charges for replacing lost or damaged permits**
 - **No forged permits**
 - **Reduced use of paper**
 - **More effective enforcement as number plates can be scanned by mobile enforcement to identify streets with larger numbers of non-permit cars**
 - **Reminders will be sent prior to the expiry of all permits – a feature which has long been requested by residents.**
- **As with the online application process, residents with no internet access will be able to ring Parking Services to apply for a permit, update their details, add on visitors or get additional support. The use of virtual permits should represent no barrier for residents without access to the internet.**

This Council resolves to:

- **Continue the planned introduction of virtual permits.**
- **Ensure local councillors are briefed on the changes ahead of the roll-out, and residents are provided with all the necessary information and support to make the transition to virtual permits as easy as possible.**

ACTION: Strategic Director Place

87. IMPROVING LEVEL 2 ATTAINMENT ACROSS THE DISTRICT

A motion was moved by Councillor Ward.

An amendment moved by Councillor Imran Khan, as set out in the resolution below, was carried.

An amendment moved by Councillor Hargreaves was defeated.

Resolved –

In June last year the Council commissioned an independent review and data analysis of Level 2 attainment after this was identified as an area of concern. This was carried out by Edge Analytics based at Leeds University. This review has been reported to the Employment and Skills Board chaired by the portfolio holder.

Further recent national research by the Children’s Commissioner has looked at the children who reach age 19 without getting 5 GCSEs (grade A*-C, equivalent to grade 9-4) or equivalent technical qualifications. These are young people who will have spent 15 years in compulsory education and yet leave the system without basic benchmark qualifications.

The research across England reveals that the percentage of children failing to reach the benchmark standard has been rising since 2015, having previously fallen between 2005 and 2015. This is, disturbingly, even more the case for children on free school meals where the percentage has increased from 28% to 37%. This compares to a smaller increase from 12% to 15% for those not on free school meals. Therefore the trend outlined above is generally more pronounced in areas with greater need.

The research reveals that out of the 152 Local Authorities included in the survey, Bradford is shown to be the 150th worst in terms of overall Level 2 attainment at the age of 19. For children on free school meals Bradford is 128th out of the 152 local authorities, with 55.9% attaining the benchmark standard.

This Council notes the findings of the research and is committed to addressing this challenge with partners.

Furthermore Council resolves to:

- 1. Put in place new governance arrangements for the delivery of the Workforce Development Plan and the newly established Bradford Employment and Skills Board which is chaired by the portfolio holder.**
- 2. Establish a Post-16 Partnership with an independent chair working to the Employment and Skills Board to champion and drive high quality post-16 education in Bradford; to support schools and colleges in promoting and spreading best practice across the education system; and to improve outcomes and progression at Level 2 by age 19.**
- 3. Task the Post-16 Partnership with delivering on measures to improve**

Level 2 attainment by age 19, with oversight from the Employment and Skills Board.

ACTION: Strategic Director Children's Services

88. PAVEMENT PARKING

A motion was moved by Councillor Griffiths.

An amendment moved by Councillor Ross-Shaw, as set out in the resolution below, was carried.

An amendment moved by Councillor Ellis was defeated.

Resolved –

That this Council believes that excessive parking on pavements is 'detrimental to the quality of life of those in the locality', especially the elderly, disabled and those with young children.

This Council therefore resolves to request the Regeneration and Environment Overview & Scrutiny Committee to consider the problem of excessive pavement parking and what options may be available to address the issue.

ACTION: Strategic Director Place

89. SUPPORTING ROUGH SLEEPERS IN BRADFORD

A motion moved by Councillor Ross-Shaw, as set out in the resolution below, was carried.

An amendment moved by Councillor Winnard was defeated.

Resolved –

Council notes:

Last year 24 rough sleepers were counted on the streets of Bradford district. Even one is too many. Rough sleeping is an indictment of our society and concerted action is needed to eliminate it. The Government's Welfare changes have led to a huge increase in people presenting at the Council's Housing Options service. From 6,411 in 2013/14 to 9,434 in 2018/19. Obviously these are not all rough sleepers, they are however people needing better housing, and our new District Housing Strategy seeks to address this challenge.

To take action on rough sleeping, Bradford Council funded a district wide Housing First pilot that commenced in August 2018.

Housing First is an internationally recognised programme of homelessness support that places people with the most complex needs directly into a home and then provides intensive support to help them address their wider

issues.

Many people who become homeless have a wide variety of complex needs that are addressed through Housing First, including rough sleeping, mental health issues and substance misuse. Housing First provides support separately to the housing so it stays with the individual if they need to move homes.

The 12 month evaluation of Housing First shows the success rate from the Bradford pilot matches or exceeds the results achieved in other Housing First projects in the UK and across Europe.

Key results include the majority of people passing the six month point of tenancy sustainment, reduction in A&E attendance and reduced length of stays in hospital, engagement with specialist substance misuse treatment and support for adhering to licence conditions through the criminal justice system.

Council resolves:

To continue support for the Housing First pilot and to expand it by investing an additional £360,000 through the budget process. This will allow for a further 10 people to benefit from the programme with additional support from outreach workers. It will also pay for further outreach support for people moving on from the original programme.

To lobby the Government for funding to ensure we can meet the identified need for this programme and guarantee funding for future years.

ACTION: Strategic Director Place

90. BRADFORD COUNCIL KEEPS UP ITS FIGHT AGAINST FLY-TIPPING

A motion was moved by Councillor Imran Khan.

An amendment moved by Councillor Love, as set out in the resolution below, was carried.

Amendments moved by Councillor Poulsen and Councillor Jeanette Sunderland were defeated.

Resolved –

Fly-tipping is illegal and it costs taxpayers in England more than £57 million a year to clear up. This Council will not tolerate people who fly-tip, blighting neighbourhoods and making people feel bad about where they live. We have already taken the following steps to reduce fly-tipping and deal with perpetrators:

- We prosecute those caught fly-tipping – since April 2016, we have carried out 93 prosecutions, including formal cautions, for waste offences including fly-tipping. We have also issued 72 Fixed Penalty Notices of £400 for fly-tipping offences and we have seized three

vans.

- We have taken advantage of new legislation to issue £250 Fixed Penalty Notices to householders who use unregistered waste carriers.
- We have stepped up media activity, including the use of social media, around prosecutions to name and shame perpetrators as well as inform others that action will be taken.
- We regularly encourage people to report fly-tipping incidents to 01274 431000.
- We are working in partnership with the police and have undertaken regular operations to identify and deal with illegal waste carriers.
- We clamped down on fly-tipping of waste during the Bonfire Night period by undertaking surveillance of bonfire hotspots including the use of electronic highway signs to raise awareness.

These actions are having a positive impact but fly-tipping continues to be a major challenge for local authorities and communities. Councils across the country took action on nearly half a million incidents in 2018/19 – around 5,000 more than the previous year and up by nearly 75,000 in six years. This Council now resolves to further invest in interventions to prevent fly-tipping as follows:

- Purchase 15 mobile cameras to catch perpetrators – 80% of prosecutions are done based on camera evidence. Cameras allow us to capture the vehicle registration and trace the owner so that the appropriate enforcement action can be taken.
- Use bunding, fencing, bouldering to defend sites which are regularly fly-tipped to prevent further incidents.
- Raise awareness and work with more private landowners and with communities to promote responsible waste management practices.
- Look at how the Council can step up enforcement activity against private land owners and landlords who don't act responsibly in safeguarding their property from becoming a fly-tipping hotspot.
- Request the Chief Executive to write to the government to demand that courts fully use the powers available to them to deal with those convicted of fly-tipping.
- Request officers to look into additional measures that can be taken to identify those responsible, such as offering rewards to residents who provide information which leads to convictions.

ACTION: *Strategic Director Place*

91. UPDATE OF THE COUNCIL'S PAY POLICY STATEMENT 2019/2020 - GRADE AND SALARY RANGE FOR THE POST OF DIRECTOR, WEST YORKSHIRE PENSION FUND

The report of the Chief Executive (**Document "P"**) reviewed and evaluated the grade and salary range for the post of Director, West Yorkshire Pension Fund.

Resolved –

- (1) That the proposed change of grade and salary range for the post of**

Director, West Yorkshire Pension Fund from Assistant Director 1 (AD1) salary range £96,603 - £102,287 to Director 1 salary range £106,131 to £116,744, be approved subject to consultation.

- (2) That the proposed update required to Appendix B of the Council's 2019/2020 Pay Policy Statement, to reflect the proposed change of grade and salary range for the post of Director, West Yorkshire Pension Fund as set out in Appendix 1 to Document "P" be approved.**
- (3) That the backdating of the grade for the post of Director West Yorkshire Pension Fund to 1 April 2019 be approved subject to consultation on the change.**

ACTION: Chief Executive/Director of Human Resources

Lord Mayor

Note: These minutes are subject to approval as a correct record at the next meeting of the Council.

THESE MINUTES HAVE BEEN PRODUCED, WHEREVER POSSIBLE, ON RECYCLED PAPER