

**MINUTES OF A MEETING OF THE COUNCIL  
HELD AT CITY HALL, BRADFORD  
ON TUESDAY 10 DECEMBER 2013**

Commenced: 1600

Concluded: 2035

**PRESENT**

The Lord Mayor (Councillor Khadim Hussain) and Councillors:

**LABOUR**

Azam	Hinchcliffe	Khaliq	M Slater
Berry	Abid Hussain	H Khan	V Slater
Billheimer	Amir Hussain	I Khan	L Smith
Dodds	Arshad Hussain	S Khan	Smithies
Dredge	Imran Hussain	Lee	Swallow
Engel	Shabir Hussain	Malik	Thirkill
Farley	Ikram	Pullen	A Thornton
Ferriby	Jabar	Ross-Shaw	G Thornton
Godward	Javed	Ruding	Wainwright
Green	Johnson	Shafiq	Warburton
Greenwood			

**CONSERVATIVE**

Binney	Heseltine	Pennington	D Smith
Brown	L'Amie	Poulsen	Sykes
Cooke	Mallinson	Shah	Townend
Davies	McCabe	Shaw	Walls
Ellis	Miller	B M Smith	Whiteley
Gibbons			

**LIBERAL DEMOCRAT**

Gray	Middleton	G Reid	Wallace
Griffiths	C Reid	Sunderland	

**BRADFORD  
INDEPENDENTS**

Ahmed  
Collector  
Karmani  
F Khan  
Shabbir

**GREEN**

Hawarun Hussain  
Love

**INDEPENDENTS**

Greaves  
Hawkesworth

**QUEENSBURY  
WARD  
INDEPENDENTS**

L Cromie  
P Cromie

**PEACE**

Imdad Hussain

**INDEPENDENT**

Robinson

**The Lord Mayor in the Chair**

**65. DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST**

The following disclosures of pecuniary interests and declarations on the basis of transparency in matters under consideration were received:

Youth Service (Minutes 72-74)

Councillor Khaliq made a declaration that his son works in a Community Centre but was not employed by the Youth Service.

Member Questions (Minute 78)

Councillor Green made a declaration in answering Question 7 that a close relative had died from asbestosis.

The declarations were made on the basis of transparency and Members remained in the meeting during consideration and voting on those items.

***ACTION: City Solicitor***

**66. MINUTES**

**Resolved –**

**That the minutes of the meeting held on 22 October 2013 be signed as a correct record.**

**67. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Akthar, Baroness Eaton, Kelly, Lal, Leeming, Naylor and Warnes.

**68. LORD MAYOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS**

**NELSON MANDELA**

It was announced that the Lord Mayor had opened a book of condolence and written to His Excellency the High Commissioner of South Africa to express sadness at the passing of Nelson Mandela, the first black president of South Africa, at the age of 95.

Members stood in silent tribute.

**CITY PARK – THE MARSH AWARD**

Judges from the Public Monuments and Sculpture Association had been highly impressed by their visit to the City Park and, on 6 November 2013, Bradford Council and Fountain Workshop Limited were named the winner of the Marsh Award, which recognised “the best use of moving water in the regeneration of urban public space”. This was the ninth accolade to be bestowed on the attraction.

## **VISITORS TO THE COUNCIL MEETING**

The Lord Mayor welcomed to the meeting the groups of young people from Laisterdyke College Debating Club; those from various local schools, resident in the Worth Valley, who were attending to help raise awareness of rural broadband issues within the Bradford district, and those present for the Youth Service petition.

## **ANNUAL CAROL SERVICE FOR THE CITY**

On Monday 23 December 2013 the annual Carol Service for the City would be held at Bradford Cathedral. The Lord Mayor indicated that everyone was welcome to attend this festive gathering.

## **SEASON'S GREETINGS**

The Lord Mayor extended warm season's greetings to all Members and Officers wishing everyone a peaceful and relaxing Christmas and a happy and healthy New Year.

## **69. INSPECTION OF REPORTS AND BACKGROUND PAPERS**

There were no restricted documents.

## **70. ORDER OF BUSINESS**

In accordance with Standing Order 4.2 a motion was moved and carried to re-order the business so that Public Question Time would be heard next followed by the petition on the Youth Service and the motions on the Youth Service dealt with as part of the same item so that the debate on the petition and motions were combined and then the remaining petitions received.

## **71. PUBLIC QUESTION TIME**

The following question was received from a resident representing the FibreValley Community Broadband Group:

"We would like to ask, what this Council is going to do to help make our campaign a success and ensure that residents and businesses across all of the Worth Valley overcome growing disadvantage and are able to fully benefit from high speed Internet access to council, NHS, educational and business services now and in the future?"

The Leader of Council's response is contained within **Document "H"**.

## **72. PETITION: YOUTH SERVICE**

A petition against reductions being made to the Youth Service budget was received in accordance with Council Standing Orders.

**Resolved –**

**That the petition be referred to the Executive for consideration during the budget process.**

***ACTION: City Solicitor (reference to Committees)***

**73. SAFEGUARDING YOUTH SERVICES**

A motion was moved by Councillor Faisal Khan and was defeated.

***NO DECISION***

**74. YOUTH SERVICES**

The motion was moved by Councillor Whiteley.

An amendment, as set out in the resolution below, was moved by Councillor Berry and was carried.

**Resolved -**

**The Council recognises the value of youth services and the important work that they perform across the District and notes that:**

- (1) Cuts in Government grants have forced the Council to reduce spending by over £100m in the last three years and the Council will have to find more cuts or extra income estimated at £115m over the next three years.**
- (2) Along with other Local Authorities, the Council has already been actively lobbying Central Government to ensure that Government funding is sufficient to meet the needs of the population we serve.**
- (3) The Executive's initial budget proposals are currently subject to an extensive programme of public consultation and to date no decisions have been taken however, the current administration has a track record of listening and responding to consultation.**

**The Council resolves to:**

- (1) Keep working to ensure that a diverse offer of activities continues to be available to young people across the Bradford District.**
- (2) Request that the Executive takes proper account of the outcomes of public consultation when formulating its final budget recommendations to Council.**

***ACTION: Strategic Director Children's Services***

**75. PETITION: CORE STRATEGY – WESTGATE HILL AREA OF BRADFORD**

A petition against proposals in the Core Strategy to build new homes in the Westgate Hill area of Bradford was received in accordance with Council Standing Orders.

**Resolved –**

**That the petition be referred to the Core Strategy consultation process.**

**ACTION:** *Strategic Director Regeneration and Culture*

**76. PETITION: SAVE OUR GREENBELT**

A petition requesting that any relaxation of current greenbelt boundaries be resisted was received in accordance with Council Standing Orders.

**Resolved –**

**That the petition be referred to the Core Strategy consultation process.**

**ACTION:** *Strategic Director Regeneration and Culture*

**77. MEMBERSHIP OF COMMITTEES**

**Resolved –**

- (1) That the appointment of Nicola Hoggart as the Environment Agency representative to replace Catherine Saxon as a co-opted member of the Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee for the remainder of the 2013/2014 municipal year be confirmed.**
- (2) That Councillor Shah be appointed to the Bradford East Area Committee in place of Councillor Sher Khan.**
- (3) That Councillor Robinson be appointed to the Bradford South Area Committee in place of Councillor Walls.**
- (4) That Councillors Imdad Hussain and Ahmed be appointed to the Bradford West Area Committee in place of Councillors Thirkill and McCabe.**
- (5) That Councillor Gibbons be appointed to the Keighley Area Committee in place of Councillor Farley.**
- (6) That Councillor Warnes be appointed to the Shipley Area Committee in place of Councillor Davies.**

**ACTION:** *City Solicitor*

**78. MEMBER QUESTION TIME**

**Council Document “F”** detailed the written questions and answers from Members to the Leader of Council and Portfolio Holders.

79. **RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE EXECUTIVE AND COMMITTEES  
RECOMMENDATION FROM THE EXECUTIVE – LOCAL PLAN CORE  
STRATEGY**

Previous reference: Executive, Minute 63 (2013-2014)

The Assistant Director Planning, Transportation and Highways submitted **Executive Document “AJ”** to the meeting of the Executive held on 19 November 2013 on the preparation of the Local Plan (formerly the Local Development Framework) which would replace the current Replacement Unitary Development Plan for the Bradford District. The first of the Local Plan documents was the Core Strategy which set out the strategic approach to managing development and change to 2030. Following consultation on the Further Engagement Draft in 2011 and 2012, a revised draft had been prepared for submission to Government for independent examination.

Council resolved to suspend Standing Order 16 to enable amendments to be voted on in numerical order. Amendments moved by Councillor Love on Policy EC4 Sustainable Economic Growth mechanism I; Policy HO5 Density of Housing Schemes key objectives; Policy HO9 Housing Quality paragraph B and adding additional paragraphs; Policy HO11 Affordable Housing section B; Planning for Places Policy EN11; and a generic amendment on removing all references to 11,000 homes being built on green belt and by Councillor Cooke on Policy BD1 paragraph 10 were defeated. The other amendments moved by Councillors Cooke and Love were carried and it was:

**Resolved –**

- (1) **That the Publication Draft Core Strategy contained in Appendix 1 to Executive Document “AJ” be approved and the associated sustainability report for the purposes of submission to the Secretary of State for independent examination pursuant to Section 20 of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 subject to the following amendments:**

**Introduction (page 2)**

Amend paragraph 1.1 to read:

1.1 Planning involves making decisions about the future of our cities, towns and countryside – where we work, where we live, where we play and how we are able to get to these destinations. It involves planning ahead to ensure that services, utilities and infrastructure are available where they are needed and attempting to balance different needs and goals ranging from our desire ~~to~~ for development, growth and regeneration to our desire to protect and conserve and enhance our built and natural environment. **We need to achieve a strategy for sustainable development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs.** Plan making involves the process of combining research and analysis with engagement and consultation with all who have a stake in making our district a great place and in the process producing a framework of policies and proposals to guide future decisions on where development will take place and in what form. Ultimately plan making is aimed at creating sustainable and vibrant communities and places.

**Section 3: Spatial Vision, Plan Objectives and Core Policies**

**Strategic Core Policy 3 (SC3) Working Together (page 32)**

Amend A to read:

A. Effective collaboration between the Council, adjoining local planning authorities, **the District's Town and Parish Councils**, partners and communities within the District, Leeds City Region and beyond.

**Strategic Core Policy 4 (SC4) Hierarchy of Settlements (page 35)**

Under "Regional City":

Add new B7:

**"Improve Connectivity between the City and the Airedale Regeneration Priority Area including access to the Regional City of Leeds via Otley Road."**

**Strategic Core Policy 4 (SC4) Hierarchy of Settlements (page 36)**

Under "Local Growth Centres":

Amend B2 to read

**"Develop new and improved** public transport links between Local Growth Centres and with Regional City of Bradford and the Principal Towns of Ilkley, Keighley and Bingley and also the Regional City of Leeds and the Principal Towns of Halifax and Skipton."

**Strategic Core Policy 4 (SC4) Hierarchy of Settlements (page 36)**

Under "Local Service Centres and Rural Areas":

Amend 2 to read:

**"Support innovative means of accessing and delivering services and the reduction of isolation particularly through the development of high speed broadband access in rural areas."**

**Strategic Core Policy 4 (SC4) Hierarchy of Settlements (page 37)**

Under "Local Service Centres and Rural Areas":

Add 7 as follows:

**"Improve public transport links between Local Service Centres and to the Regional City of Bradford, Principal Towns of Ilkley, Keighley and Bingley, the Regional City of Leeds, and the Principal Towns of Halifax and Skipton."**

**Strategic Core Policy 5 (SC5) Location of Development (page 42)**

Amend B2 to read:

"2. Takes into account capacity constraints and deliverable improvements particularly in relations to **junctions improving and development of** on the Strategic Road Network **including junctions and schemes identified in the Spatial Vision.**"

**Strategic Core Policy 7 (SC7) Green Belt (page 48)**

Amend B to read:

“Green Belt releases ~~will be needed~~ **required** to deliver long term housing and jobs growth in the District as set out on Policy HO3 and Policy EC3 ~~and~~ will be delivered by a selective review of Green Belt boundaries in locations that would not undermine the strategic function of the green belt within LCR and that would accord with the Core policies and the strategic patterns of development set out in policy SC5. The decisions on allocations of green belt land will be assessed against the purposes of including land in green belt as set out in national guidance. **The selective review will be undertaken through the Allocations DPD in consultation with local communities and stakeholders.**”

**Policy 1 (BD1) The Regional City of Bradford (including Shipley and Lower Baildon) (page 62)**

Amend F6 to read:

“Develop critical road and public transport infrastructure in South East **and North West Bradford**, the Canal Road Corridor and to the east of Shipley so as to ensure the viability and delivery of housing and economic growth in the City of Bradford.”

**Policy 2 (BD2) – Investment Priorities for the City of Bradford (including Shipley and Lower Baildon) (page 66)**

Amend C. to read:

C. To provide infrastructure to support site assembly, manage flood risk and improve access to Bradford city centre and Shipley Town centres as part of regeneration initiatives on the Shipley and Canal Road Corridor **including development of a Shipley Eastern Relief Road.**

**Section 4: Sub Area Policies**

**Policy 2 (BD2) – Investment Priorities for the City of Bradford (including Shipley and Lower Baildon) (page 66)/**

**Sub Area Policy 2 (AD2) Investment Priorities for the Airedale Sub Area (page 72)/**

**Sub Area Policy 2 (WD2) Investment Priorities for the Wharfedale Sub Area (page 76)/**

**Sub Area Policy 2 (PN2) Investment Priorities for the South Pennine Towns and Villages Sub Area (page 80)**

Add:

**“To support the development and extension of high speed broadband especially in rural and other less accessible areas.”**

**Section 4: Sub Area Policies**

**Airedale Sub Area Policy 1 (AD1) (page 68)**

**Wharfedale Sub Area Policy 1 (WD1) (page 74)**

**South Pennine Towns and Villages Sub Area Policy 1 (PN1) (page 78)**

Add New Economic Development:



**“Support initiatives for the sustainability and diversification of agricultural and rural enterprise and for the extension of high speed broadband to rural communities.”**

**South Pennine Towns and Villages Sub Area Policy 1 (PN1) (page 77/78)**

Amend B. second paragraph last sentence:

“Provision will be made for associated community facilities in particular health care facilities at Denholme, **and a community centre at** Cullingworth and recreation facilities in ~~Cullingworth and~~ Haworth.”

Add new F5 Transport:

**“Support improved transport links within the Pennine towns and villages and to the Regional City of Bradford, the Principal Towns of Keighley, Ilkley, Bingley and Skipton and the Regional Town of Halifax particularly for the Local Growth Areas of Queensbury and Thornton.”**

**Section 5: Thematic Policies – 5.1 Planning for Prosperity – Economy and Jobs – Policy EC1 Creating a Successful and Competitive Bradford District Economy within the Leeds City Region (page 85)**

Amend L to read:

“ICT **and communications** infrastructure, **installation** and take up of **high speed** broadband particular as a priority in rural and peripheral areas of the Bradford District.”

Add new M:

**“Support diversification and sustainability of agricultural and rural businesses.”**

Existing M becomes N

**5.1 Planning for Prosperity – Economy and Jobs – Policy EC2 Supporting Business and Job Creation (page 87)**

Amend C to read:

“Supporting and improving the vitality **and viability** of the City Centre and lower order town and district centres.”

**5.1 Planning for Prosperity – Economy and Jobs – Policy EC4 Sustainable Economic Growth (page 92)**

Amend criterion G.

“Promoting developments which help diversify and strengthen the rural economy of the District including support for rural industries, reuse of existing buildings, farm diversification, ~~and~~ support for live-work opportunities **and through the extension of high speed broadband to rural communities.**”

### **5.1 Transport and Movement –Policy TR1 Travel Reduction and Modal Shift (page 104)**

Opening paragraph: Add “...**improve air quality**...” after ‘congestion’

Add new G.

**“Encourage development that reduces travel needs through the promotion of home working and live/work.”**

### **5.2 Planning for People – Housing – HO1 10 Principles for Achieving Housing Growth (page 122)**

Amend principle 6 of Policy HO1 to read:

Ensuring that housing development meets high standards of construction and design **including the incorporation of low carbon technologies and renewable energy generation wherever feasible and viable.**

### **5.2 Planning for People – Housing – HO5 Density of Housing Schemes (page 142)**

Amend B. to read:

“Densities should normally achieve at least a minimum of 30 dwellings per hectare ~~and developers may be required to achieve higher densities than this~~ **although higher densities would be possible** in areas well served by public transport **and/or close to the City Centre and Principal Town Centres.**”

### **5.3 Planning for Places – Environment – Policy EN3 Historic Environment (page 187)**

Amend C6 to read:

“The literary **and other** associations of Haworth **and conservation area of Thornton** with the Bronte family.”

### **5.3 Planning for Places – Environment – Policy EN8 Environmental Protection (page 208/09)**

Amend opening paragraph – section in brackets – to read:

“...(including noise, **odour** and light pollution)”

Amend C. Nuisance to read:

“Proposals for development must identify potential nuisance issues (including noise, vibration, **odour**, light and dust) arising from the nature of the proposal and address impacts on that development from existing land uses.”

- (2) **That prior to submission the publication draft be issued for formal representations for a period of 6 weeks in the New Year.**

- (3) That the Assistant Director (Planning Transportation and Highways) in consultation with the relevant portfolio holder be authorised to make minor amendments of redrafting or of a similar nature as may be necessary prior to formal publication for representations of the Core Strategy Publication Draft contained in Appendix 1 to Executive Document “AJ”.
- (4) That delegated authority be given to the Assistant Director Planning Transportation and Highways in consultation with the relevant portfolio holder to submit the document to the Secretary of State once the 6 week period for representations has been completed.

**ACTION:** *Strategic Director Regeneration and Culture*

**80. RECOMMENDATION FROM THE GOVERNANCE AND AUDIT COMMITTEE – ANNUAL TREASURY MANAGEMENT REPORT 2012/13**

Previous reference: Governance and Audit Committee, Minute 37 (2013-2014)

On 1 November 2013 the Governance and Audit Committee considered a report of the Director of Finance **Governance and Audit Committee Document “U”** which showed the Council’s Treasury Management activities for the year ending 31 March 2013.

**Resolved -**

**That the Annual Treasury Management report 2012/13 be adopted.**

**ACTION:** *Director of Finance*

**81. RECOMMENDATION FROM THE GOVERNANCE AND AUDIT COMMITTEE – TREASURY MANAGEMENT MID YEAR REVIEW UP TO 30 SEPTEMBER 2013**

Previous reference: Governance and Audit Committee, Minute 38 (2013-2014)

On 1 November 2013 the Governance and Audit Committee considered a report of the Director of Finance **Governance and Audit Committee Document “V”** which presented the Council’s Treasury Mid Year Review up to 30 September 2013.

**Resolved**

**That the Treasury Mid Year Review up to 30 September 2013 be adopted.**

**ACTION:** *Director of Finance*

**82. DISTRIBUTION OF PUBLIC SPENDING AND INVESTMENT**

A motion, as set out in the resolution below, was moved by Councillor Green and was carried.

An amendment moved by Councillor Cooke was defeated.

**Resolved -**

This Council notes that there are regional imbalances in the current and proposed distribution of public spending and investment the consequences of which have seen:-

- Resources provided by Government to Bradford Council reduce by disproportionate amounts compared to some other parts of the country.
- Proposals to redistribute NHS funding away from Clinical Commissioning Groups in Bradford to other parts of the country.
- Long standing issues of lower levels of spending per person on infrastructure, transport, housing and culture in Yorkshire than in London, the South-East and Scotland.

The Council is concerned that if these trends continue they could lead to an increasing imbalance between local services and regional economies that will be detrimental to the interests of Bradford District, increase health inequalities between Bradford and other parts of the country and jeopardise the future viability of some public services.

The Council therefore resolves to request all Group Leaders to agree and sign a joint letter to the Chancellor of the Exchequer requesting that the Government urgently seeks to:

- (1) Re-profile the distribution of national public spending to address current inconsistencies and secure a balanced approach to economic investment and growth.
- (2) Ensure that a higher proportion of funding for local government is distributed according to need and that Councils are provided with the stability required to support effective financial planning.
- (3) Provide funding for all new responsibilities required of Councils arising from the Care Bill currently going through Parliament.
- (4) Recognise the cumulative effects of reductions in public spending on Bradford District.
- (5) Provide local government with increased powers to raise income and to deliver economic growth.

**ACTION:** *Chief Executive/Director of Finance*

**83. REVEREND PAUL FLOWERS – BRADFORDIANS WANT CRYSTAL CLARITY NOT MYTHS**

The motion was moved by Councillor Karmani.

An amendment, as set out in the resolution below, was moved by Councillor Green and was carried.

An amendment was also moved by Councillor Hawkesworth.

**Resolved -**

**This Council notes that proactive steps have already been taken to establish a chronology of the events surrounding the resignation from the Council of former Councillor Revd. Paul Flowers and a report on the decisions taken by people involved in those events.**

**As a result of this action information regarding the individuals involved and the actions that they took are in the public domain.**

***NO ACTION***

**84. HAMZAH KHAN SERIOUS CASE REVIEW**

The motion was moved by Councillor Shabbir.

An amendment, as set out in the resolution below, was moved by Councillor Berry and was carried.

An amendment was also moved by Councillor Shabbir.

**Resolved -**

**This Council is deeply saddened by the tragic death of Hamzah Khan.**

**The Council resolves to continue to place the highest priority on safeguarding children and adults irrespective of race, creed or faith and to continue to build on existing training and development programmes designed to identify unmet needs and improve practice.**

***ACTION: Strategic Director Children's Services***

**85. WEST YORKSHIRE COMBINED AUTHORITY: GOVERNMENT CONSULTATION**

The report of the Strategic Director Regeneration and Culture (**Document "G"**) updated Members and sought approval from Council on the approach proposed to responding to the constitutional arrangements and functions of a Combined Authority for the area of West Yorkshire as set out in the Government consultation.

**Resolved -**

- (1) That the publication of the Government consultation paper which invites the submission of views by Thursday 2 January 2014 be welcomed.**
- (2) That the proposed constitutional arrangements and functions of the Combined Authority as set out in the consultation paper be endorsed.**
- (3) That the proposed approach to responding to the consultation be approved.**
- (4) That the Chief Executive (in consultation with the City Solicitor and Leader) be authorised to make a formal response to DCLG confirming the Council's support for the establishment of the Combined Authority and to take such other steps as are considered appropriate to facilitate the preparation of the Order.**

- (5) That the next steps and timetable be noted, and in particular that providing Government is satisfied that the proposals for a Combined Authority for West Yorkshire command wide local support and also meet the required statutory conditions, the Secretary of State will invite Parliament to approve the Order establishing the Combined Authority.

**ACTION:** *Strategic Director Regeneration and Culture*

Chair

**Note: These minutes are subject to approval as a correct record at the next meeting of Council.**

minutes\ccl10Dec

THESE MINUTES HAVE BEEN PRODUCED, WHEREVER POSSIBLE, ON RECYCLED PAPER